

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

OBJECTIVES.

The objectives of this project were to: **1.)** Host an expert workshop to identify research needs for opportunistic premise (i.e., building) plumbing pathogens (OPPPs); **2.)** With the assistance of the workshop participants, prepare this research report that critically reviews the state of the knowledge of OPPPs and identifies key research gaps; and **3.)** Develop and rank a list of requests for proposals (RFPs) that address these key research gaps.

BACKGROUND.

The successful mitigation of microbiological hazards in drinking water represents one of the 10 greatest engineering achievements of the 20th century. Widespread implementation of water treatment and disinfection have virtually eliminated incidence of diseases such as typhoid in the United States. In 2008, however, the U.S. Centers for Disease Control and Prevention acknowledged that a greater incidence of waterborne disease outbreaks are attributable to microbes that persist and grow in premise plumbing (especially *Legionella pneumophila*) versus traditional fecal-borne pathogens leaving the treatment plant. “Premise plumbing” refers to the portion of potable water distribution systems beyond the property line and in buildings (e.g., businesses, schools, private homes, apartments). Addressing these OPPPs poses a logistical challenge because water systems are designed and regulated to control pathogens leaving the water treatment facility, whereas OPPPs reside and multiply in building water systems. The five model OPPPs that were the focus of this study were: *Legionella pneumophila*, *Mycobacterium avium* Complex (MAC), *Pseudomonas aeruginosa*, *Acanthamoeba* spp., and *Naegleria fowleri*. In particular, addressing these OPPPs is challenged by research gaps in four key areas: **1.) Epidemiology.** Increasing incidence of infection and outbreak and broad, non-traditional susceptibility groups suggest that OPPPs are more than “opportunistic” in that a significant and increasing portion of the population is at risk. However, because *L. pneumophila* is the only reportable OPPP, and only on a voluntary basis, there is very little information on the actual incidence of diseases caused by OPPPs. Further, while several studies have demonstrated premise plumbing to be a source of opportunistic pathogen infection, very little is known about dose-response and to what extent potable water contributes to disease relative to other sources. **2.) Methodology.** There are no detailed accepted standardized methodologies or protocols for detecting and quantifying viable and infectious OPPPs in potable water, especially when the objective requires simultaneous monitoring of multiple pathogens. Specifically, knowledge gaps exist with respect to optimal selection of monitoring points, sampling methods, and sample processing. Further, culture-based methods can be influenced by reduced recovery of viable cells, can provide poor quantitation, are time-consuming, and are subject to contamination. While molecular-based methods are gaining ground, improvements are still generally needed in terms of their target specificity and detection limits for live and infectious pathogens. **3.) Microbial Ecology.** Premise plumbing is a unique ecological niche and home to a robust microbial ecology of which OPPPs are integral members. In particular, the bacterial OPPPs have a tendency to infect and grow in pathogenic and non-pathogenic amoeba, a process that not only enhances bacterial OPPP reproduction, but can also increase their virulence. Many OPPPs are also relatively resistant to disinfectants (especially *M. avium* Complex) and thrive under the

extreme oligotrophic condition of drinking water. Understanding the range of environmental conditions and key interactions with other microbes is critical to development of strategies to limit OPPP proliferation in building plumbing. **4.) Engineering Controls.** There are currently no known engineering controls that reliably limit proliferation of all OPPPs under all circumstances. Further, some approaches may reduce numbers of one pathogen, but may stimulate another, or have unintended consequences on the integrity of the plumbing system as a whole. In spite of the complexity of the situation and depending on the circumstances, it appears that combined efforts of various stakeholders, ranging from water utilities to building proprietors, may be effective in reducing risks to consumers.

APPROACH.

The workshop participants gathered and consulted to guide the development of this critical review document. Expertise included representatives from academia, utilities, government agencies, and industry. For the preparation of this document the participants were assigned to teams and challenged to summarize the state of the knowledge and identify knowledge gaps in the four key areas of Epidemiology, Methodology, Microbial Ecology, and Engineering Controls. Nine conference calls were conducted from September to December, 2011, for discussion and development of this literature review. Contributing authors developed written text, which were integrated into this final document and further reviewed by the workshop participants and the PAC. On March 25 and 26, 2012, an expert workshop was conducted in Falls Church, Virginia, where key outcomes of the review, critical knowledge gaps, and emergent research needs were presented and discussed in great depth. The purpose was to recommend a path forward to generate the fundamental and practical knowledge necessary to addressing the importing public health challenge that OPPPs pose. A total of 20 RFPs were developed and ranked by the workshop participants. These RFPs may be considered by research sponsors that share in their understanding of the importance of OPPPs.

RESULTS/CONCLUSIONS.

The ultimate products of this report are the 20 ranked RFPs, described in the final chapter. These summarize and highlight the most pressing research needs for addressing OPPPs. Two of the top three RFPs dealt with Epidemiology research needs. Specifically, determining the prevalence, incidence and trends of OPPP disease was identified as the top research need. Expanding this to identify sources and weights of various sources of OPPP disease ranked third. The second highest ranked RFP highlighted the need for improved Methodology in terms of appropriate sampling and monitoring strategies that provide meaningful data for determining risk of OPPP infection or outbreaks. The fourth highest ranked RFP called for a molecular-based spatial and temporal survey of OPPPs in premise plumbing systems. The fifth highest ranked RFP called for a study to determine the level of control that water treatment plants and the distribution system microbiome have on premise plumbing Microbial Ecology. The top ranked RFP with respect to Engineering Controls is research calling for identification of the fundamental factors/mechanisms that control detachment and release of OPPPs from biofilms in premise plumbing, which ranked 6th overall. Specifically, the 20 RFP titles, in ranked order, were:

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

We thank our Water Research Foundation Research Manager, Mary Smith, for her helpful support and guidance in this research project. We also sincerely thank the Project Advisory Committee: Marilyn M. Marshall (University of Arizona); Marsha Pryor (Pinellas County Florida); Maggie Rogers (Cleveland Division of Water); and Andrew J. Whelton (University of South Alabama) for their insight and enthusiasm that they offered to this project. Finally, we thank the students: Jordan Bird, Randi Brazeau, Lindsay Hamilton, Amanda Martin, Sheldon Masters, William Rhoads, and Hong Wang for their impeccable attention to detail in the organization of the workshop and for their support in preparing the document. A special thanks to Randi Brazeau for her special touch in managing the project and organizing the workshop. Finally, we thank participants from the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (U.S. EPA) and the U.S. Centers for Disease Control (CDC). The views expressed in this report are those of the individual authors and do not necessarily reflect the views and policies of the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, CDC, or otherwise the employers of the authors.

FOREWORD

The Water Research Foundation (Foundation) is a nonprofit corporation dedicated to the development and implementation of scientifically sound research designed to help drinking water utilities respond to regulatory requirements and address high-priority concerns. The Foundation's research agenda is developed through a process of consultation with Foundation subscribers and other drinking water professionals. The Foundation's Board of Trustees and other professional volunteers help prioritize and select research projects for funding based upon current and future industry needs, applicability, and past work. The Foundation sponsors research projects through the Focus Area, Emerging Opportunities, and Tailored Collaboration programs, as well as various joint research efforts with organizations such as the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency and the U.S. Bureau of Reclamation.

This publication is a result of a research project fully funded or funded in part by Foundation subscribers. The Foundation's subscription program provides a cost-effective and collaborative method for funding research in the public interest. The research investment that underpins this report will intrinsically increase in value as the findings are applied in communities throughout the world. Foundation research projects are managed closely from their inception to the final report by the staff and a large cadre of volunteers who willingly contribute their time and expertise. The Foundation provides planning, management, and technical oversight and awards contracts to other institutions such as water utilities, universities, and engineering firms to conduct the research.

A broad spectrum of water supply issues is addressed by the Foundation's research agenda, including resources, treatment and operations, distribution and storage, water quality and analysis, toxicology, economics, and management. The ultimate purpose of the coordinated effort is to assist water suppliers to provide a reliable supply of safe and affordable drinking water to consumers. The true benefits of the Foundation's research are realized when the results are implemented at the utility level. The Foundation's staff and Board of Trustees are pleased to offer this publication as a contribution toward that end.

Roy L. Wolfe, Ph.D.
Chair, Board of Trustees
Water Research Foundation

Robert C. Renner, P.E.
Executive Director
Water Research Foundation

RESEARCH NEEDS FOR OPPORTUNISTIC PATHOGENS IN PREMISE PLUMBING

Prepared by:

Amy Pruden
Virginia Tech

Marc A. Edwards
Virginia Tech

Joseph O. Falkinham, III
Virginia Tech

Contributing authors:

Matt Arduino
U.S. Centers for Disease
Control

Jordan Bird
Virginia Tech

Rhonda Birdnow
Denver Water

Emily Benard
Montreal Polytech

Anne Camper
Montana State University

Jennifer Clancy
Tetra Tech

Marc A. Edwards
Virginia Tech

Joseph O. Falkinham III
Virginia Tech

Elizabeth Hilborn
U.S. Environmental
Protection Agency

Vince Hill
U.S. Centers for Disease
Control

Amanda Martin
Virginia Tech

Sheldon Masters
Virginia Tech

Norm Pace
University of Colorado at
Boulder

Michele Prevost
Montreal Polytech

Amy Pruden
Virginia Tech

Aaron Rosenblatt
Gordon & Rosenblatt, LLC

William Rhoads
Virginia Tech

Janet Stout
University of Pittsburgh

Yan Zhang
Long Beach Water

Workshop Participants:

Matt Arduino

U.S. Centers for Disease
Control

Nicholas J. Ashbolt

U.S. Environmental
Protection Agency

Jordan Bird

Virginia Tech

Rhonda Birdnow

Denver Water

Paul Bishop

University of Rhode Island

Gary Burlingame

City of Philadelphia

Randi Brazeau

Virginia Tech

Emily Benard

Montreal Polytech

Anne Camper

Montana State University

Jennifer Clancy

Tetra Tech

Marc A. Edwards

Virginia Tech

Joseph O. Falkinham III

Virginia Tech

Lindsay Hamilton

Virginia Tech

Elizabeth Hilborn

U.S. Environmental
Protection Agency

Vince Hill

U.S. Centers for Disease
Control

Michael Ingerson-Mahar

American Society for
Microbiology

Mark LeChevallier

American Water

France Lemieux

Health Canada

Amanda Martin

Virginia Tech

Sheldon Masters

Virginia Tech

Norm Pace

University of Colorado at
Boulder

Michele Prevost

Montreal Polytech

Amy Pruden

Virginia Tech

Marsha Pryor

Pinellas County, FL

Aaron Rosenblatt

Gordon & Rosenblatt, LLC

William Rhoads

Virginia Tech

Joan Rose

Michigan State University

Susan Springthorpe

University of Ottawa

Janet Stout

University of Pittsburg

Hong Wang

Virginia Tech

Yan Zhang

Long Beach Water

Sponsored by:

Water Research Foundation

6666 West Quincy Avenue, Denver, CO 80235

Published by:

Water Research Foundation

DISCLAIMER

This study was funded by the Water Research Foundation (Foundation). The Foundation assumes no responsibility for the content of the research study reported in this publication or for the opinions or statements of fact expressed in the report. The mention of trade names for commercial products does not represent or imply the approval or endorsement of the Foundation.

This report is presented solely for informational purposes.

Copyright © 2012
by Water Research Foundation

ALL RIGHTS RESERVED.

No part of this publication may be copied, reproduced
or otherwise utilized without permission.

ISBN xxx-x-xxxxx-xxx-x

Printed in the U.S.A.

CONTENTS

LIST OF TABLES	XV
LIST OF FIGURES	XVII
LIST OF ACRONYMS	XVII
FOREWORD	XXI
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS	XXIII
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	XXV
Objectives.	xxv
Background.	xxv
Approach.	xxvi
Results/Conclusions.	xxvi
Applications/Recommendations.	xxvii
Multimedia (optional).	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Research Partners (optional).	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Participants (optional).	xxviii
CHAPTER 1: OVERVIEW OF OPPORTUNISTIC PREMISE PLUMBING PATHOGENS (OPPPS)	1
Opportunistic premise plumbing pathogens	1
Development of this Document and Role of the Expert Workshop	2
Document Scope and Organization	2
CHAPTER 2: EPIDEMIOLOGY OF OPPPS	3
OPPPs: Definitions and surveillance	3
Habitats, exposure routes, and implications for OPPP control	4
epidemiology of <i>L. pneumophila</i>	5
<i>Legionella</i> Strains and Serotypes	6
Risk Factors for Legionnaires' Disease	7
Linkage of Premise Plumbing and <i>Legionella</i> Disease	7
Transmission of <i>Legionella</i>	8
<i>Legionella</i> Risk Assessment and Management	9
Epidemiology of <i>M. avium</i> and Other Nontuberculous <i>Mycobacteria</i> (NTM)	10
NTM History, Disease, and Prevalence	10
Role of Various NTM Species in Disease	11
Risk Factors for <i>M. avium</i> Complex Disease	11
Linking NTM and <i>M. avium</i> in Premise Plumbing to Disease	12
NTM Risk Assessment and Management	13

Epidemiology of <i>Pseudomonas aeruginosa</i>	14
<i>Pseudomonas aeruginosa</i> Disease and Prevalence.....	14
Risk Factors for <i>Pseudomonas aeruginosa</i> Infection	15
Linking <i>Pseudomonas</i> in Premise Plumbing to Disease.....	15
Transmission of <i>Pseudomonas</i>	16
<i>Pseudomonas</i> Risk Assessment and Management	16
Epidemiology of <i>Acanthamoeba</i>	17
<i>Acanthamoeba</i> Disease and Prevalence.....	17
Risk Factors for <i>Acanthamoeba</i> Infection	18
Linking <i>Acanthamoeba</i> in Premise Plumbing to Disease.....	18
Transmission of <i>Acanthamoeba</i>	19
<i>Acanthamoeba</i> Risk Assessment and Management.....	19
Epidemiology of <i>N. fowleri</i>	19
<i>Naegleria</i> Disease and Prevalence.....	19
Transmission of <i>Naegleria</i>	20
Linking <i>Naegleria</i> in Premise Plumbing to Disease.....	20
<i>Naegleria</i> Risk Assessment and Management.....	21
CHAPTER 3: MICROBIAL PHYSIOLOGY AND ECOLOGY	23
Common physiological and ecological features among oppps.....	23
Physiology and Microbial Ecology of <i>L. pneumophila</i>	24
<i>Legionella</i> Physiology	24
<i>Legionella</i> Ecology	25
Physiology and Microbial Ecology of NTM and <i>M. avium</i>	28
Physiology of NTM and <i>M. avium</i>	28
Ecology of NTM and <i>M. avium</i>	31
Physiology and Ecology of <i>P. aeruginosa</i>	33
Physiology of <i>P. aeruginosa</i>	33
Microbial Ecology of <i>P. aeruginosa</i>	33
Physiology and Ecology of <i>Acanthamoeba</i>	35
Physiology of <i>Acanthamoeba</i>	35
Ecology of <i>Acanthamoeba</i>	36
Physiology and Ecology of <i>N. fowleri</i>	37
Physiology of <i>N. fowleri</i>	37
Ecology of <i>N. fowleri</i>	38
CHAPTER 4: DETECTION METHODOLOGY.....	41
Overview.....	41
<i>L. pneumophila</i>	43
Sampling and Monitoring Considerations	43
Sample Concentration Procedures	44
Culture-Based Techniques	44
Molecular and Serological Methods	45
Phenotypic Assays	47
Methodology Gaps for <i>L. pneumophila</i>	48
NTM and <i>M. avium</i>	50
Field Sampling Techniques.....	50

Culture-Based Techniques	51
Molecular Methods	52
Methodology Gaps for NTM	53
<i>Pseudomonas aeruginosa</i>	53
Sampling and Monitoring Considerations	54
Culture-Based Techniques	54
Most Probable Number (MPN) and Phenotypic Assays.....	54
Molecular Methods	55
Methodology Gaps for <i>P. aeruginosa</i>	55
<i>Acanthamoeba</i> spp.	56
Sampling and Monitoring	56
Microscopic examination.....	56
Culture-Based techniques	56
Molecular Methods	57
Methodology Gaps for <i>Acanthamoeba</i> spp.....	59
<i>Naegleria fowleri</i>	60
Sampling and Monitoring Considerations	60
Culture-Based Techniques	62
Molecular Methods	62
Methodology Gaps for <i>N. fowleri</i>	63

CHAPTER 5: METHODOLOGY FOR SIMULATING DRINKING WATER SYSTEM

ENVIRONMENT	65
General Laboratory Assay Challenges for Opportunistic Pathogens	65
chapter 5: Systems for simulating drinking water systems and pathogen integration.....	66
Introduction.....	66
Batch Reactors	67
Continuous flow stirred tank reactors (CFSTRs).....	67
Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC) Reactor.....	68
Annular Reactors	68
Plug Flow Reactors (PFRs).....	69
Flow Cells	70
Robbins Device and Modified Robbins Device.....	71
Biofilm Monitor	71
Tubing Reactors	71
Pipe Reactors	72
Different Modes of Operating CFSTRs and PFRs	73
Sidestream Devices	73
Considerations on Reactor Selection	73
Considerations on System Operation.....	74
Pure culture versus mixed populations	74
Choice of the base biofilm	75
Influent water – choice and composition.....	75
Choice of pathogen	76
Pathogen inoculation.....	76
Continuous versus intermittent flow	76
Biofilm Sampling Techniques	77

Methodological Gaps for Simulating Drinking Water Environment for Laboratory Study	78
CHAPTER 6: POTENTIAL AND LIMITATIONS OF ENGINEERED CONTROLS FOR OPPORTUNISTIC PREMISE PLUMBING PATHOGENS.....	
Engineering and Regulatory Realities	79
Shared Responsibility Approach.....	82
Engineered Approaches that Influence OPPPs.....	85
Source Water Treatment and Distribution System Maintenance.....	85
In-Building Temperature Control	86
Disinfection with Chlorine/Chloramine.....	89
Other In-Building Disinfectants.....	89
Nutrient Control and Limitation	90
Microbial Ecology Controls.....	90
Plumbing Materials.....	91
Water Flow Patterns.....	91
Whole building, point of use and showerhead filters	92
Specific Devices Such As Metered Faucets.....	92
Synthesis and Overview of Engineering Controls	93
Future complications in water quality.....	93
CHAPTER 7: REQUESTS FOR PROPOSALS (RFPS)	
#1–EPI 1: Prevalence, incidence and trends of OPPP disease.....	98
Background:	98
Problem:	98
Approach:.....	98
Risk of Approaches and Anticipated Rewards:	98
Stakeholders:.....	98
Estimated Budget:	98
#2 RFP –Meth 1: Appropriate sampling and monitoring strategies for OPPPs.	99
Background:	99
Problem:	99
Approach:.....	99
Risk of Approaches and Anticipated Rewards:	99
Stakeholders:.....	100
Estimated Budget:	100
Background:	101
Problem:	101
Approach:.....	101
Risk of Approaches and Anticipated Rewards:	101
Stakeholders:.....	101
Estimated Budget:	101
#4 RFP –Meth 2: Molecular-based spatial and temporal survey of OPPPs.	102
Background:	102
Problem:	102
Approach:.....	102
Risk of Approaches and Anticipated Rewards:	102

Stakeholders:.....	103
Estimated Budget:.....	103
#5 RFP-Ecol 1: Relationship between distribution system and microbiota of premise plumbing.....	104
Background:.....	104
Problem:.....	104
Approach:.....	104
Risk of Approaches and Anticipated Rewards:.....	104
Stakeholders:.....	105
Estimated Budget:.....	105
#6 RFP-Eng 2: Fundamental factors/mechanisms controlling detachment and release of OPPPs from biofilms in premise plumbing.....	106
Background:.....	106
Problem:.....	106
Approach:.....	106
Risk of Approach and Anticipated Rewards:.....	106
Stakeholders:.....	106
Estimated Budget:.....	106
#7 RFP-Eng 1: Impact of water treatment on control of OPPPs in premise plumbing.....	107
Background:.....	107
Problem:.....	107
Approach:.....	107
Risk of Approach and Anticipated Rewards:.....	107
Stakeholders:.....	107
Estimated Budget:.....	107
#8 RFP –Ecol 3: Mechanisms of chloramine and chlorine impact on OPPPs.....	108
Background:.....	108
Problem:.....	108
Approach:.....	108
Risk of Approaches and Anticipated Rewards:.....	108
Stakeholders:.....	108
Estimated Budget:.....	108
#9 RFP –EPI- 3: Communication of OPPP prevalence, incidence and trends.....	109
Background:.....	109
Problem:.....	109
Approach:.....	109
Risk of Approaches and Anticipated Rewards:.....	109
Stakeholders:.....	110
Estimated Budget:.....	110
#10 RFP –Meth 3: Comparison between culture-based and molecular-based techniques for OPPPs.....	111
Background:.....	111
Problem:.....	111
Approach:.....	111
Risk of Approaches and Anticipated Rewards:.....	112
Stakeholders:.....	112

Estimated Budget:.....	112
#11 RFP-Eng 5: Optimizing the design of hot water systems to achieve temperature control of OPPPs and prevent amplification.....	113
Background:.....	113
Problem:.....	113
Approach:.....	113
Risk of Approaches and Anticipated Rewards:	113
Stakeholders:.....	113
Estimated Budget:.....	113
#12 RFP –Ecol 2: Role of free-living amoebae (FLA) in enhancing persistence, survival, and growth of OPPPs.....	114
Background:.....	114
Problem:	114
Approach:.....	114
Risk of Approaches and Anticipated Rewards:	114
Stakeholders:.....	114
Estimated Budget:.....	114
#13 RFP- Eng 3: Understanding chlorine, chlorine dioxide and chloramine demand in hot water premise plumbing.....	116
Background:	116
Problem:	116
Approach:.....	116
Risk of Approaches and Anticipated Rewards:	116
Estimated Budget:.....	116
#14 RFP –Ecol 4: Potential for microbial ecological controls on OPPPs.....	117
Background:.....	117
Problem:	117
Approach:.....	117
Stakeholders:.....	117
Estimated Budget:.....	117
#15 RFP-EPI 4: Is <i>Hartmanella</i> spp. or <i>Acanthamoeba</i> spp. of more significance for bacterial OPPPs?.....	118
Background:.....	118
Problem:	118
Approach:.....	118
Risk of Approaches and Anticipated Rewards:	118
Stakeholders:.....	119
Estimated Budget:.....	119
#16 RFP- Eng 4: Determining why electronic faucets sometimes harbor high levels of OPPPs.....	120
Background:.....	120
Problem:	120
Approach:.....	120
Risk of Approaches and Rewards:.....	120
Stakeholders:.....	120

#17 RFP –EPI 5: Contributions of bacterial, viral, and eukaryotic microbiota to OPPP disease.....	121
Background:.....	121
Problem:.....	121
Approach:.....	121
Risk of Approaches and Anticipated Rewards:	121
Stakeholders:.....	121
Estimated Budget:.....	121
#18 RFP –Ecol 5: Potential contribution of disinfection and other management practices on emergence of multi-antibiotic resistant pathogens?.....	122
Background:.....	122
Problem:.....	122
Approach:.....	122
Risk of Approaches and Anticipated Rewards:	122
Stakeholders:.....	122
Estimated Budget:.....	122
#19 RFP –Eng 6: Secondary impacts of in-building disinfection on corrosion of galvanized iron, stainless steel, copper, and brass.	123
Background:.....	123
Problem:.....	123
Approach:.....	123
#20 RFP –Meth 4: Characterization of OPPP pangenomes for advancing molecular targets for OPPPs.	124
Background:.....	124
Problem:.....	124
Approach:.....	124
Risk of Approaches and Anticipated Rewards:	124
Stakeholders:.....	124
Estimated Budget:.....	124
GLOSSARY	125
REFERENCES	139

