

1 **Development of unconventional natural gas reservoirs poses a threat to surface** 2 **waters**

3 Sally Entekin¹, Michelle Evans-White², Brent Johnson³, Elisabeth Hagenbuch⁴

4 ¹ Biology Department, University of Central Arkansas, Conway, AR 72034

5 ² Department of Biological Sciences, University of Arkansas, Fayetteville, AR 72701

6
7 ³ U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, National Exposure Research Laboratory,
8 Cincinnati, OH 45268

9 ⁴ Dynamac Corporation c/o US EPA, Cincinnati, OH 45268

10 **Abstract**

11 Natural gas development is expanding in **unconventional natural gas reservoirs** around
12 the world and poses multiple environmental threats to surface waters. Improved drilling
13 and extraction technology used to access unconventional natural gas requires millions
14 of gallons of water and a suite of chemicals possibly toxic to aquatic biota. There is
15 growing concern among the scientific community and public that rapid and extensive
16 natural gas development in the U.S. could lead to degradation of natural resources.
17 Gas wells are often close to surface waters that could be impacted by increasing
18 sediment runoff from pipelines and roads, alteration of stream flow from water
19 extraction, and contamination from introduced chemicals or produced wastewaters.
20 However, data required to fully understand these potential threats are currently lacking.
21 Scientists therefore have the opportunity to develop novel studies that address potential
22 changes in ecosystem structure and function that will inform sound environmental
23 policy.

24 **In a nutshell**

- 25 • Natural gas development in unconventional natural gas reservoirs may pose
26 environmental threats.
27
- 28 • Surface waters near natural gas wells are vulnerable to sediment runoff, reduced
29 water flow, and possible contamination from introduced chemicals and produced
30 wastewater.
31
- 32 • Federal and state environmental regulations may not prevent or mitigate
33 damaging effects to surface waters.
34
- 35 • Quantitative data and innovative research are needed to understand possible
36 environmental effects from natural gas development.
37

38 **Introduction**

39

40 Natural gas development has increased dramatically with advances in extraction
41 technology and the need for cleaner burning fuels that help meet global energy
42 demands. Natural gas is considered a bridge fuel to renewable energy resources
43 because combustion releases fewer contaminants (e.g., CO₂, NO_x, SO_x) than coal or
44 petroleum. Horizontal drilling and hydraulic fracturing, or hydrofracking, now allow
45 development of vast shale gas reserves previously considered inaccessible or
46 unprofitable. Shale gas production in the United States is expected to increase three
47 fold, and will account for nearly half of all natural gas produced by 2035 (EIA, 2011).
48 This widespread proliferation of new gas wells and use of modern drilling and extraction
49 methods has now been identified as a global conservation issue (Sutherland et al.,
50 2011). Here we describe the ecological threats to surface waters associated with
51 increased natural gas development in shale basins, and highlight opportunities for
52 research to address these threats.

53 **Horizontal Drilling and Hydraulic Fracturing**

54 Gas well drilling has historically used a single vertical well to access gas trapped in
55 permeable rock formations (e.g., sandstone) where gas flows freely through pore
56 spaces to the wellbore. Unlike these conventional sources, unconventional gas
57 reservoirs are low permeability formations such as coal beds, tight sands, and shale
58 that require fracturing and propping before gas can travel freely to the wellbore.
59 Hydrofracking uses high pressure fracturing fluids, consisting of large volumes of water
60 and numerous chemical additives, to create fractures, while added propping agents
61 such as sand keep fractures open to allow gas flow. Though hydrofracking was first
62 used in the 1940s, the practice was not widely applied until the 1990s, when gas prices
63 increased and advances in horizontal drilling made the technique more productive.
64 Horizontal drilling increases the volume of rock a single well can access, thereby
65 reducing density of well pads required at the surface. **The horizontal leg of a gas well is
66 fractured in discrete lengths of 300 to 500 feet, therefore there may be up to 15 separate
67 hydrofrack 'events' along one horizontal well** (Kargbo et al. 2010). Fracturing depth
68 depends on target formations, but varies from 150 to >4,000 m for the major shale
69 formations in the United States (DOE, 2009)

70 **Extent of resources**

71 The United States currently has 72 trillion cubic meters (tcm) of potentially accessible
72 natural gas, enough to last 110 years based on 2009 rates of consumption (EIA, 2011).
73 Approximately 23 tcm of that gas is found in unconventional gas reservoirs, where
74 development has increased 65% since 1998 (DOE, 2009). There are 29 shale basins
75 spanning 20 states, which are expected to contribute 45% of the total U.S. gas
76 produced by 2035 (Figure 1a, EIA, 2011). Furthermore, the U.S. gas supply represents
77 only a fraction of the total global estimate of potentially accessible natural gas (459 tcm)
78 and only 11% outside of North America has been recovered (MIT, 2010). Development
79 of potentially accessible natural gas is expected to increase with increasing global
80 demand and transfer of drilling technologies overseas.

81 **Problem statement/purpose**

82 The increase in natural gas development threatens surface water quality at multiple
83 points, creating a need to assess and understand the overall costs and benefits of
84 extracting the resource from shale reservoirs. Gas well development of any type
85 creates surface disturbances from land clearing, infrastructure development, and
86 release of contaminants produced from formation waters (e.g., brines). Use of hydraulic
87 fracturing, however, poses additional environmental threats from water withdrawals and
88 contamination from fracking fluid chemicals. Extraction of gas from shale formations
89 may also produce significantly more methane than conventional wells and could have a
90 greater greenhouse gas footprint than other fossil fuels (Howarth et al., 2011).
91 Furthermore, gas wells can be close to streams and occur at high densities in
92 productive areas, resulting in cumulative impacts within watersheds. Environmental and
93 human health concerns associated with hydrofracking have stirred much debate and the
94 practice has received attention of national media (Urbina, 2011) and researchers alike
95 (EPA, 2004, 2011; Kargbo, 2010; Colborn et al., 2011, Osborn et al., 2011). Research
96 addressing concerns with increased drilling and hydrofracking in shale basins have
97 primarily focused on contaminants that threaten drinking and ground water, whereas
98 data collection to address concerns associated with surface water and terrestrial
99 ecosystems has been largely overlooked. Our goal is to encourage ecological studies
100 related to the potential environmental impacts. We use data from the Fayetteville and
101 Marcellus shale formations to demonstrate the recent increases in drilling activity, well
102 proximity to streams, and well drainage area density relationships with stream turbidity.
103 We also review other potential threats to aquatic freshwater ecosystems increased
104 natural gas development and highlight challenges and opportunities for novel research.

105 **Focus areas**

107 The Fayetteville and Marcellus are among the most productive shale basins in the U.S.
108 The Fayetteville shale basin covers more than 23,000 km² of Arkansas and eastern
109 Oklahoma at a depth of 300-2000 m (Figure 1a). The number of gas wells there has
110 increased nearly 50-fold, from 60 to 2,834 wells, since 2005 in a concentrated area of
111 north-central Arkansas (Figure 1b and 1c). The Marcellus spans 240,000 km² at a
112 depth of 1200 to 2500 m and underlies six states in the Upper Mid Atlantic, including
113 much of the Appalachian basin (Figure 1d). Estimates indicate natural gas reserves in
114 the Marcellus to be 14 tcm or 59% of the total estimated unconventional reserves in the
115 U.S. (DOE, 2009). In summer 2010, the Marcellus had 3,758 natural gas wells with
116 projections of up to 60,000 wells in the next 30 years (Johnson, 2011). The Marcellus
117 formation also underlies sensitive watersheds such as the threatened Upper Delaware
118 River, a designated wild and scenic river that supplies drinking water to >15 million
119 people (DRBC 2008). The rapid development of gas wells in relatively concentrated
120 areas may increase the likelihood of ecological impacts to surrounding forests and
121 streams.

122 **Proximity of gas well development to water resources**

123 We initially assessed proximity of active gas wells to water resources using state well
124 location data and the National Hydrography Dataset (NHD). Spatial analysis indicated

125 that gas wells averaged 300 m from streams for both the Fayetteville and Marcellus
126 shale formations, yet several hundred wells were located within 100 m of stream
127 channels (Table 1). Gas wells averaged 15 km from public surface water drinking
128 supplies and 37 km and 123 km from public well water supplies in the Marcellus and
129 Fayetteville shale reservoirs, respectively (Table 1). Although wells are generally
130 constructed far from public drinking water sources, there is potential for wastewater to
131 travel long distances since many of the components of the produced waters are
132 conservative (e.g. brine) and will not settle out or be assimilated into biomass.
133 Furthermore, the NHD underestimates the density of headwater stream channels
134 (Heine et al., 2004), so our proximity measures likely underestimate the threat to
135 streams. Therefore, we used Geographic Information System (GIS) tools to generate
136 detailed drainage area networks in portions of the Fayetteville and Marcellus shale
137 reservoirs where gas well densities are concentrated. The terrain processing tools in
138 ArcHydro Tools 9 version 1.3 (an ArcGIS extension) were used to generate drainage
139 area lines from 10 meter digital elevation models
140 (DEM; <http://seamless.usgs.gov/ned13.php>) in a subset of drainage areas in each shale
141 play. A stream threshold of 500 (50,000 m²) was used to define stream channels in the
142 model. Gas well proximity was analyzed again with a subset of modeled stream
143 drainage areas and the same subset of NHD flowlines for comparison (Table 2, Figure
144 2). Active gas wells were an average of 130 and 153 m from modeled drainage areas
145 compared to 230 and 252 m from NHD flowlines in the Fayetteville and Marcellus shale
146 reservoirs, respectively. Over 80% of the active gas wells were located within 300 m of
147 modeled drainage areas (Table 2). Because the modeled drainage areas estimate
148 some intermittent and ephemeral channels, the proximity of wells to stream channels
149 (and potential for downstream impacts) is greater than reflected by NHD flowline data.
150 This process may provide a more accurate assessment of potential stream impacts,
151 particularly if shale gas development continues at its current rate. As well densities
152 continue to increase, the proximity of wells to stream channels may increase, resulting
153 in a greater risk of streamflow reductions from pumping, contamination from leaks
154 and/or spills from produced waters or fracking fluids, and sedimentation from
155 infrastructure development (e.g. pipelines and roads).

156 **Environmental regulation**

157
158 Environmental regulation of oil and gas drilling is complex and varies greatly among
159 states. The Safe Drinking Water Act (SDWA) provides federal laws for protecting
160 surface/ground waters and human health, but with the exception of diesel fuel injection,
161 hydraulic fracturing operations are exempt as a result of the 2005 Energy Policy Act.
162 State agencies are therefore primarily responsible for regulation and enforcement of
163 environmental issues associated with natural gas development. The rapid growth and
164 expansion of U.S. gas drilling has made regulation difficult and violations are common.
165 In Pennsylvania alone, there were >1400 drilling violations from January 2008 to
166 October 2010 (PADEP, 2010). Of these, nearly half dealt with contamination of surface
167 waters and included direct discharge of pollutants, improper erosion control, or failure to
168 properly contain wastes. In contrast, the Arkansas Department of Environmental
169 Quality cited only 15 surface water violations in the Fayetteville shale in 2010; but over

170 half dealt with permitting and discharge violations associated with natural gas
171 development (ADEQ, 2010). The discrepancy in violations between states
172 demonstrates the variable degree of regulation at the state level and is likely attributed
173 to both differences in regulations and available regulatory resources. Regardless, the
174 number and proportion of violations associated with natural gas development indicates
175 that sediments and contaminants associated with drilling are making their way into
176 surface waters, yet studies of ecological effects are lacking. Primary threats to surface
177 waters and potential exposure pathways (Figure 3) include:

178

179 **Sediments**

180

181 Excessive sediments are one of the primary threats to U.S. surface waters (EPA, 2006)
182 and have multiple negative effects in lotic food webs (Wood and Armitage, 1999). Gas
183 well installation activities can negatively affect lotic ecosystems by increasing sediment
184 inputs from well pads and supporting infrastructure (roads, pipelines, stream crossings),
185 as well as loss of riparian area. Typically, a least 1.5-3 ha of land must be cleared for
186 each well pad, depending on the number of wells per pad, and in high densities well
187 pads can cumulatively alter the landscape. Land clearing and stream disturbance
188 during well and infrastructure development can increase sediments in surface water
189 runoff (Williams et al., 2008) resulting in increased suspended and benthic sediments in
190 surface waters. Nutrients bound to these sediments may also have impacts on surface
191 waters.

192

193 We identified seven streams in the Fayetteville shale with a gradient of well densities
194 among drainage areas to test the prediction that stream turbidity would be positively
195 related to the density of gas wells. The seven stream drainages were delineated using
196 the ArcHydro extension in ArcMap (Version 9.3.1; ESRI, Redlands, CA). Using gas well
197 location data from Arkansas Oil and Gas Commission, well density was quantified for
198 each drainage area as the total number of wells divided by the drainage area. Turbidity
199 samples were collected in April, 2009 during high spring flow (Lamotte 2020; Hach).
200 Pearson product moment correlations identified a positive relationship between stream
201 water turbidity and well density (Figure 4). Turbidity was not positively correlated to
202 other land cover variables, but there was a strong negative correlation between turbidity
203 and drainage area and percent pasture cover in the watershed (Table 3). These
204 preliminary data suggest cumulative effects from well development and associated
205 infrastructure may be detectable at the landscape scale.

206

207 **Water withdrawal may alter flow regime**

208

209 Surface waters may serve as sources for necessary drilling and fracking fluids; each
210 well uses between 2 to 7 million gallons of source water. There is potential for
211 fracturing of multiple wells per well pad over the life span of the well development
212 (which may take several decades), which compounds required water use. Many gas
213 wells are installed in regions where water is already withdrawn for agriculture and may
214 further stress the resource. Stream flow may be negatively affected if streams are
215 dammed to create holding ponds or if water is directly extracted for the fracturing

216 process. The rapid and concentrated extraction of water could create regional shortages
217 during dry periods, resulting in an altered flow regime and the further degradation of
218 critical habitat to aquatic biota, particularly if low order streams are primary sources. A
219 reduction in stream flow may also result in secondary effects, such as increased
220 contaminant concentrations and reduced downstream water quality because less water
221 is available for dilution or conversely, lower transport distances of contaminants.

222

223

224 **Release of wastewaters**

225

226 Surface water contamination from hydrofracking fluids and produced water (i.e. water
227 flowing back out of the well along with the gas) is most likely to occur during
228 hydrofracking or treatment and disposal processes when the potential for accidental
229 spills and leaking is greatest. Contamination from hydrofracking wastes can also occur
230 through inadequate waste treatment practices, improper storage, inadequately
231 constructed impoundments or well casings, and improper disposal of solid wastes (i.e.,
232 poorly lined impoundments that are buried onsite) that may leach into nearby surface
233 waters. Wastewater impoundment ponds can also pose a threat to exposed wildlife and
234 livestock.

235

236 Fracturing fluids typically include a combination of additives that serve as friction
237 reducers, cross-linkers, breakers, surfactants, biocides, pH adjusters, scale inhibitors,
238 and gelling agents (NYSDEC, 2009). The aim of additives is to achieve an ideal
239 viscosity that encourages fracturing and gas flow, but discourages microbial growth and
240 corrosion that can inhibit recovery efficiency (DOE, 2009). Composition of the fracturing
241 fluids can vary greatly among wells and shale formations. Specific content is most often
242 proprietary, though some States require disclosure of constituents and companies may
243 voluntarily register their chemicals. A recent Congressional investigation revealed
244 that, over a four year period, 14 leading gas companies used over 2,500 hydrofracking
245 products that contained 750 different chemicals, 29 of which were highly toxic or known
246 carcinogens. Fracturing fluids used over the period totaled 780 million gallons (not
247 including dilution water), and included lead, benzene, ethylene glycol, diesel,
248 formaldehyde, and benzene, toluene, ethylbenzene, xylene compounds (House
249 Committee on Energy and Commerce, 2011). The volume of fracking fluids recovered
250 is also highly variable, but unrecovered amounts can be substantial. Only 10-30% of
251 fracture fluids are typically recovered from wells in portions of the Marcellus Shale
252 (NYDEC 2009). Yet information on the fate and transport of these unrecovered
253 chemicals are lacking.

254

255 Produced waters pose a threat to surface waters because they typically contain not only
256 fracking additives, but also elevated metals, dissolved solids (e.g, brine), organics, and
257 radionuclides that occur naturally in geologic formation waters. Onsite waste
258 impoundments or evaporation ponds could overflow, spill, or leach into groundwater and
259 contaminate nearby streams. Even after treatment, total dissolved solids (TDS) are
260 very high and remaining salts are often disposed of through land application or used as
261 road salts, which are known to enter surface waters and contribute to increased stream

262 salinization (Kaushal et al., 2005). Recovered wastewaters are most often transported
263 offsite for deep well injection (aka underground injection control [UIC]) or transported to
264 domestic wastewater treatment plants (WWTP) and/or conventional waste treatment
265 facilities (CWTs). After fracturing, initially recovered flowback water is sometimes
266 reused as fracking fluid for other wells. Reuse of recovered fluids is becoming more
267 common, but still requires a significant amount of freshwater because of low recovery
268 volumes and required dilution of concentrated flowback (i.e., chlorides, sulfates, barium,
269 etc). Domestic WWTPs are not capable of treating the high TDS (5,000->100,000
270 mg/L) typical of recovered wastewater. Many WWTP have therefore been forced to
271 limit the amount of recovered hydrofracking waste intake to remain in compliance with
272 effluent limitations (Veil, 2010). Industrial WWTPs are better equipped to treat
273 recovered wastes using reverse osmosis, filtration, or chemical precipitation, but such
274 facilities are costly and not widely available. Therefore, billions of gallons of produced
275 water are being generated annually on a national scale (Clark and Veil 2009), water
276 treatment options are limited, and the potential ecological impacts of wastes on
277 terrestrial and aquatic ecosystems are not well studied.

278

279 **Challenges and potential for novel research**

280

281 Quantifying effects of natural gas development in shale basins on surface waters is
282 challenging because multiple companies are often working in the same geographic area
283 using different fracturing techniques (e.g., varied and often proprietary composition of
284 fracturing fluids) with uncoordinated timing of infrastructure development and well
285 fracturing. In addition, the degree to which these companies adhere to best
286 management practices, such as buffer strips and erosion control devices, varies among
287 companies, states, and agencies. Further, wells occur across human-impacted
288 watersheds that may confound the ability to attribute effects from gas well development.

289

290 Most studies examining effects of sediments on biological communities have focused on
291 shifts in abundance, biomass, diversity, or community composition (Wood and
292 Armitage, 1999). Fewer studies have examined how sediments alter species roles and
293 their interactions (but see Hazelton and Grossman, 2009). In addition, contaminant
294 effects are often assessed using single-species laboratory acute and chronic toxicity
295 tests with model organisms (Cairns, 1983) and with single contaminants. Studies are
296 needed to address toxicity of contaminant mixtures (e.g., produced water and fracking
297 fluids) and their effects on more complex communities and ecosystems to predict
298 effects in the real world (Clements and Newman, 2002). Sediment and contaminants
299 associated with recovered wastewater will likely affect organism behavior and alter
300 ecological interactions at sublethal levels (Evans-White and Lamberti, 2009).

301 Reductions in feeding efficiencies (Sandheinrich and Atchison, 1989) can lead to
302 negative effects on reproduction (Burkhead and Jelks, 2001) and growth (Peckarsky,
303 1984) and may alter the strength of species interactions causing changes in community
304 structure. Therefore, ecologists examining the effects of natural gas extraction can
305 contribute to scientific understanding by examining the effects of sediment and
306 contaminants from natural gas development on community interactions.

307

308 In addition to needs for traditional bioassessments, the inevitable alteration in land use
309 that will occur from increased drilling offers a template for conducting novel experiments
310 in an ecosystem context. Ecosystem functions serve as integrative metrics that are
311 suited for detecting large-scale alterations with multiple factors affecting processing
312 rates (Bunn et al., 1999). For example, reduced stream flows, contaminants from
313 produced wastewater and fracking fluids, and increased sediment inputs would alter
314 ecosystem functions, such as whole-stream metabolism, decomposition of organic
315 matter, and secondary production of macroinvertebrates. However, it is not known how
316 natural gas development could influence biological processing rates. The potential
317 effects may stimulate or inhibit specific ecosystem functions. For example, increased
318 sedimentation or chemical contamination associated with natural gas well development
319 could increase macroinvertebrate production by expanding habitat for tolerant,
320 multivoltine taxa (Stone and Wallace, 1998) or lead to a decline in production by
321 eliminating sensitive taxa representing a majority of community growth and/or biomass
322 (Woodcock and Huryn, 2007). A move to incorporate ecosystem functions into
323 mainstream biological assessment and restoration protocols is currently underway (Fritz
324 et al., 2010), yet few studies have been conducted to inform their implementation and
325 interpretation in context with concurrent structural changes (Young and Collier, 2009).
326 The rapid expansion of gas development across the U.S. could provide a framework to
327 implement concurrent structural and ecosystem experiments to inform process-based
328 ecoassessment. Furthermore, ecological studies relating to natural gas extraction could
329 be combined with similar studies for surface mining (Fritz et al., 2010; Bernhardt and
330 Palmer, 2011) to gain a more holistic view of environmental costs associated with
331 extraction of fossil fuels.

332
333 The distinct elemental composition and isotopic signatures of produced water provide
334 unique opportunities for tracer studies that can indicate exposure to aquatic systems.
335 Stable isotopes of strontium and carbon have been used to trace water from coalbed
336 natural gas production wells to surface waters and hyporheic zones (Brinck and Frost,
337 2007). Osborn (2011) used isotopes of water, carbon, boron and radium to test for
338 hydraulic fracturing contamination of shallow aquifers overlying the Marcellus and Utica
339 shale formations in Pennsylvania and New York and found significant changes in
340 methane concentrations in drinking water wells near to where gas wells have been
341 drilled. Limited research has also suggested that methane-derived carbon is assimilated
342 in stream food webs (Kohzu et al., 2004; Trimmer et al., 2010). Many gas bearing
343 geologic formations also contain elevated levels of naturally occurring radioactive
344 materials, such as radon (^{222}Rn) and Radium (^{226}Ra , ^{228}Ra) that can be used as
345 hydrologic tracers (Genereux and Hemond, 1990). The extent to which metals,
346 organics, or other contaminants from the drilling and hydrofracking process may
347 ultimately enter aquatic and terrestrial food webs remains unknown.

348 349 **Conclusions**

350
351 Natural gas exploration will continue to increase globally. In addition to the potential
352 threats to groundwater and drinking water sources, increasing environmental stress to
353 surface water ecosystems is of serious concern. To date, scientific data that will inform

354 ecologically sound development are needed to ensure protection of our water
355 resources. Increased sediment runoff into streams, reductions in streamflow,
356 contamination of streams from accidental spills, and inadequate treatment practices of
357 recovered wastewaters are realistic threats. Gas wells are often close to streams,
358 increasing the probability of harm to surface waters and preliminary data suggests
359 potential for detectable effects from increased sedimentation. Further ecological
360 research on impacts from developing natural gas well infrastructure are sorely needed
361 and will inform future regulatory strategies and further our understanding of factors
362 affecting community structure and ecosystem function.

363

364 **Acknowledgements**

365

366 We thank Amy Bergdale, Reid Adams, Ginny Adams, and Lindsey Lewis for early
367 conversations that helped develop our interest in this research topic. Ellen D'Amico
368 provided valuable assistance on spatial analysis of well placement and suggestions that
369 helped to shape the manuscript. Amy Bergdale, Walter Dodds, Mark Drew, Ken Fritz,
370 and Katherine Larson provided comments on early drafts of the manuscript that greatly
371 improved the document. The views expressed in this article are those of the author(s)
372 and do not necessarily reflect the views or policies of the U.S. Environmental Protection
373 Agency.

374

375

376

377 **References**

- 378 ADEQ (Arkansas Department of Environmental Quality). Water violations database.
379 http://www.adeg.state.ar.us/legal/cao_info.asp. Viewed August 25, 2010
380
- 381 Bernhardt ES and MA Palmer. 2011. The environmental costs of mountaintop mining
382 valley fill operations for aquatic ecosystems of the Central Appalachians. *Ann N Y Acad*
383 *Sci* **1223**: 39-57.
384
- 385 Brinck EL and CD Frost. 2007. Detecting infiltration and impacts of introduced water
386 using strontium isotopes. *Ground Water* **45**: 554-68.
387
- 388 Bunn SE, PM Davies, and TD Mosisch. 1999. Ecosystem measures of river health and
389 their response to riparian and catchment degradation. *Freshw Biol* **41**: 333-45.
390
- 391 Burkhead NM and HL Jelks. 2001. Effects of suspended sediment on the reproductive
392 success of the tricolor shiner, a crevice-spawning minnow. *Trans Am Fish Soc* **130**:
393 959-68.
394
- 395 Cairns JJ. 1983. Are single-species toxicity tests alone adequate for estimating
396 environmental hazard? . *Hydrobiologia* **100**: 47-57.
397
- 398 Clark, C.E., and J.A. Veil, 2009, Produced Water Volumes and Management Practices
399 in the United States, ANL/EVS/R-09/1, prepared by the Environmental Science Division,
400 Argonne National Laboratory for the U.S. Department of Energy, Office of Fossil
401 Energy, National Energy Technology Laboratory, September
402 ANL/EVS/R-09/1
- 403
- 404 Clements W and M Newman, 2002. Community ecotoxicology. John Wiley & Sons,
405 LTD, The Atrium, Southern Gate, Chichester, West Sussex PO19 8SQ, England.
406
- 407 Colborn TC, C Kwiatkowski, K Shultz, and M Backstrom. 2011. Natural gas operations
408 from a public health perspective. *International Journal of Human and Ecological Risk*
409 *Assessment*.
410
- 411 DOE (United States Department of Energy). 2009. Modern shale gas development in
412 the United States: A primer. Washington, D.C., United States Department of Energy.
413 DE-FG26-04NT15455.
414
- 415 Delaware River Basin Commission. 2008. 2008 Annual Report.
- 416
- 417 EIA (Energy Information Administration, United States Department of Energy). 2011.
418 Annual Energy Outlook. Washington, D.C., Energy Information Administration, United
419 States Department of Energy. DOE/EIA-0383ER(2011).
420

- 421 EPA (United States Environmental Protection Agency, Office of Water). 2004.
422 Evaluation of impacts to underground sources of drinking water by hydraulic fracturing
423 of coalbed methane reservoirs study. Washington, D.C., United States Environmental
424 Protection Agency, Office of Water. EPA 816-F-04-017.
425
- 426 EPA (United States Environmental Protection Agency, Office of Water). 2006.
427 Wadeable stream assessment: a collaborative survey of the nation's streams.
428 Washington, D.C., United States Environmental Protection Agency, Office of Water.
429 EPA 841-B-06-002
430
- 431 EPA (United States Environmental Protection Agency, Office of Water). 2011. Draft
432 plan to study potential impacts of hydraulic fracturing on drinking water resources.
433 Washington, D.C., United States Environmental Protection Agency, Office of Research
434 and Development. EPA/600/D-11/001
435
- 436 Evans-White MA and GA Lamberti. 2009. Direct and Indirect Effects of a Potential
437 Aquatic Contaminant on Grazer-Algae Interactions. *Environ Toxicol Chem* **28**: 418-26.
438
- 439 Fritz KM, S Fulton, BR Johnson, CD Barton, JD Jack, DA Word, and RA Burke. 2010.
440 Structural and functional characteristics of natural and constructed channels draining a
441 reclaimed mountaintop removal and valley fill coal mine. *J North Am Benthol Soc* **29**:
442 673-89.
443
- 444 Genereux D and H Hemond. 1990. Naturally occurring Radon 222 as a tracer for
445 streamflow generation: steady state methodology and field sample. . *Water Resources*
446 *Research* **26**: 3065-75.
447
- 448 Hazelton PD and GD Grossman. 2009. Turbidity, velocity and interspecific interactions
449 affect foraging behaviour of rosyside dace (*Clinostomus funduloides*) and yellowfin
450 shiners (*Notropis lutippinis*). *Ecol Freshw Fish* **18**: 427–36.
451
- 452 Heine R, C Lant, and R Sengupta. 2004. Development and comparison of approaches
453 for automated mapping of stream channel networks. . *Annals of the Association of*
454 *American Geographers* **94**: 477-90.
455
- 456 Howarth RW, R Santoro, and A Ingraffea. 2011. Methane and the greenhouse-gas
457 footprint of natural gas from shale formations. *Clim Change* **106**: 679-90.
458
- 459 Johnson N (The Nature Conservancy). 2011. Pennsylvania Energy Impacts
460 Assessment: Report 1: Marcellus Shale Natural Gas and Wind. Philadelphia, PA, The
461 Nature Conservancy.
462
- 463 Kargbo DM, Wilhelm, R.G., Campbell, D.J. 2010. Natural Gas Plays in the Marcellus
464 Shale: Challenges and Potential Opportunities. *Environmental Science and Technology*
465 **44**: 5679-84.
466

- 467 Kaushal SS, PM Groffman, GE Likens, KT Belt, WP Stack, VR Kelly, LE Band, and GT
468 Fisher. 2005. Increased salinization of fresh water in the northeastern United States.
469 *Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A* **102**: 13517-20.
470
- 471 Kohzu A, C Kato, T Iwata, D Kishi, M Murakami, S Nakano, and E Wada. 2004. Stream
472 food web fueled by methane-derived carbon. *Aquat Microb Ecol* **36**: 189-94.
473 MIT (Massachusetts Institute of Technology). 2010. The future of natural gas :an
474 interdisciplinary MIT study. Cambridge, MA, Massachusetts Institute of Technology.
475 978-0-9828008-0-5.
476
- 477 NYSDEC (New York State Department of Environmental Conservation, Division of
478 Mineral Resources). Well permit issuance for horizontal drilling and high-volume
479 hydraulic fracturing to develop the Marcellus Shale and other low-permeability gas
480 reservoirs. <http://www.dec.ny.gov/energy/58440.html>. Viewed November 5, 2010
481
- 482 Osborn SG, A Vengosh, NR Warner, and RB Jackson. 2011. Methane contamination of
483 drinking water accompanying gas-well drilling and
484 hydraulic fracturing. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*.
485
- 486 PADEP (Pennsylvania Department of Environmental Protection). Violations database.
487 [http://www.dep.state.pa.us/dep/deputate/minres/OILGAS/OGInspectionsViolations/OGI](http://www.dep.state.pa.us/dep/deputate/minres/OILGAS/OGInspectionsViolations/OGInspviol.htm)
488 [nspviol.htm](http://www.dep.state.pa.us/dep/deputate/minres/OILGAS/OGInspectionsViolations/OGInspviol.htm) Viewed December 8, 2010
489
- 490 Peckarsky B. 1984. Do predaceous stoneflies and siltation affect structure of stream
491 insect communities colonizing enclosures? *Can J Zool* **63**: 1519-30.
492
- 493 Sandheinrich M and G Atchison. 1989. Sublethal copper effects on bluegill, *Lepomis*
494 *macrochirus*, foraging behavior. *Can J Fish Aquat Sci* **46**
495 1977-85.
496
- 497 Stone MK and JB Wallace. 1998. Long-term recovery of a mountain stream from
498 clearcut logging: the effects of forest succession on benthic invertebrate community
499 structure. *Freshw Biol* **39**: 151-69.
500
- 501 Sutherland WJ, S Bardsley, L Bennun, M Clout, IM Cote, MH Depledge, LV Dicks, AP
502 Dobson, L Fellman, E Fleishman, DW Gibbons, AJ Impey, JH Lawton, F Lickorish, DB
503 Lindenmayer, TE Lovejoy, R Mac Nally, J Madgwick, LS Peck, J Pretty, SV Prior, KH
504 Redford, JPW Scharlemann, M Spalding, and AR Watkinson. 2010. Horizon scan of
505 global conservation issues for 2011. *Trends Ecol Evol* **26**: 10-16.
506
- 507 Trimmer M, S Maanoja, AG Hildrew, JL Pretty, and J Grey. 2010. Potential carbon
508 fixation via methane oxidation in well-oxygenated riverbed gravels. *Limnol Oceanogr* **55**:
509 560-68.
510
- 511 United States House of Representatives Committee on Energy and Commerce. 2011.
512 Chemicals used in hydraulic fracturing.

513
514 Urbina I. 2011. Drilling down (series). *New York Times*. Feb-March.
515 http://topics.nytimes.com/top/news/us/series/drilling_down/index.html Viewed 27 April
516 2011.
517
518 Veil JA (United States Department of Energy, National Energy Technology Laboratory).
519 2010. Final report: water management technologies used by Marcellus shale gas
520 producers. Washington, D.C., United States Department of Energy, National Energy
521 Technology Laboratory Award No. FWP 49462.
522
523 Williams HFL, DL Havens, KE Banks, and DJ Wachal. 2008. Field-based monitoring of
524 sediment runoff from natural gas well sites in Denton County, Texas, USA.
525 *Environmental Geology* **55**: 1463-71.
526
527 Wood PJ and PD Armitage. 1999. Sediment deposition in a small lowland stream -
528 Management implications. *Regulated Rivers-Research & Management* **15**: 199-210.
529
530 Woodcock TS and AD Huryn. 2007. The response of macroinvertebrate production to a
531 pollution gradient in a headwater stream. *Freshw Biol* **52**: 177-96.
532
533 Young RG and KJ Collier. 2009. Contrasting responses to catchment modification
534 among a range of functional and structural indicators of river ecosystem health. *Freshw*
535 *Biol* **54**: 2155-70.
536
537
538

Table 1: Number of active, permitted, and spud natural gas wells each year since 2005 for Arkansas, New York, West Virginia, Ohio, and Pennsylvania.

	State	Total Wells	Total Operators	Distance to NHD Flowlines (mean \pm SD, range, m)	Total # (percent) of wells within 100 meters of NHD Flowlines (m)	Total # (percent) of wells within 200 meters of NHD Flowlines (m)	Total # (percent) of wells within 300 meters of NHD Flowlines (m)	Distance to Public Water Wells (mean \pm SD, range, km)	Distance to Public Drinking Water Intakes (mean \pm SD, range, km)
Marcellus	PA	2091 ¹	59	319 \pm 171 (8-1172)	74 (4)	577 (28)	1141 (55)	25.83 \pm 17.93 (0.32-79.60)	14.83 \pm 10.06 (0.60-50.23)
	WV	1599 ²	86	214 \pm 143 (1-850)	409 (26)	798 (50)	1198 (75)	52.32 \pm 32.81 (0.55-125.42)	11.16 \pm 5.36 (0.53-33.32)
	OH	42 ³	12	230 \pm 153 (46-691)	8 (19)	23 (55)	33 (79)	71.85 \pm 28.29 (26.46-138.17)	14.15 \pm 8.38 (1.54-29.87)
	NY	26 ⁴	9	247 \pm 182 (27-631)	9 (35)	12 (46)	14 (54)	10.47 \pm 7.11 (2.58-34.19)	16.59 \pm 9.06 (4.58-35.63)
	All States	3758		273 \pm 168 (1-1172)	500 (13)	1410 (38)	2386 (64)	37.51 \pm 28.88 (0.32-138.17)	13.27 \pm 8.55 (0.53-50.23)
Fayetteville	AR	2834 ⁵	21	353 \pm 241 (7-1642)	269 (10)	900 (32)	1434 (51)	123.67 \pm 11.12 (78.94-156.12)	15.15 \pm 7.49 (0.66-133.43)

¹ PA: Pennsylvania Department of Environmental Protection Bureau of Oil and Gas (permits and updates through 9/30/2010)

<http://www.dep.state.pa.us/dep/deputate/minres/oilgas/reports.htm>

--"Active" Determination: used "New Wells Drilled by Month" reports (through 9/30/2010)

² WV: West Virginia Geological and Economic Survey (permits through 3/31/2010 and updates through early 9/2010)

<http://www.wvges.wvnet.edu/www/datastat/devshales.htm>

--"Active" Determination: used spud dates

³OH: Ohio Department of Natural Resources Division of Mineral Resources Management (permits and updates through 9/30/2010)

<http://www.dnr.state.oh.us/mineral/database/tabid/17730/Default.aspx>

--"Active" Determination: used spud dates

⁴NY: New York State of Environmental Conservation (permits and updates through 9/30/2010)

<http://www.dec.ny.gov/energy/1603.html>

--"Active" Determination: used spud dates

⁵AR: Arkansas Oil and Gas Commission (permits and updates through 9/30/2010)

<http://www.aogc.state.ar.us/> (data downloaded from: <ftp://www.aogc.state.ar.us/>)

---"Active" Determination: Lots of data were missing in this file. I used the following data in the following order: 1. the commencement date (if available, not always entered in their system), 2. the completion date (if available, not always entered in their system), 3. production data (may be delayed a few months), 4. total drill depth > 1 (estimated date from other prior permit statuses)

Table 2. Proximity of natural gas wells to stream channels modeled using the terrain processing tools in ArcHydro Tools 9 version 1.3 (an ArcGIS extension) to generate drainage area lines from a 10 meter digital elevation model (DEM; <http://seamless.usgs.gov/ned13.php>) compared to well proximity to National Hydrography flowlines.

		Subset		Previous Distances (In Marcellus, PA only)		Subset			Previous Distances (In Marcellus, PA only)		
		range (m)	mean \pm SD (m)	range (m)	mean \pm SD (m)	within 100m	within 200m	within 300m	within 100m	within 200m	within 300m
Marcellus*	Drainage area Lines	4-316	153 \pm 56	--	--	17%	80%	100%	--	--	--
	NHD Flowlines	48-681	252 \pm 114	8-1172	319 \pm 171	5%	39%	70%	4%	28%	55%
Fayetteville**	Drainage area Lines	0-420	130 \pm 70	--	--	32%	71%	82%	--	--	--
	NHD Flowlines	1-933	230 \pm 136	7-1642	353 \pm 241	12%	43%	61%	10%	32%	51%

*Processed for 615 of 3758 wells (16%), processed 42 of 559 HUC-12 Units containing well point locations (8%)

**Processed for 2372 of 2834 wells (84%), processed 55 of 84 HUC-12 Units containing well point locations (65%)

Table 3. Pearson product moment correlations and associated p-values between turbidity (NTU) and other landscape-level variables including land cover (USGS, 2006) and drainage area. Analyses were run in SigmaPlot 11.

Correlates	r	p-value
well density	0.91	0.003
drainage area	-0.86	0.01
low impact urban	0.35	0.44
wood/herbaceous	-0.63	0.12
forest	-0.36	0.42
pasture	-0.88	0.008

Figures

Figure 1: National map of all unconventional natural gas plays in the lower 48 states (a); density of wells in the Fayetteville unconventional natural gas play (b); number of gas wells installed in the Fayetteville and Marcellus plays from 2005 to present (c); and density of wells in the Marcellus shale play (d). Densities were calculated using the kernel density tool in ArcMap 9.3.1.

Figure 2. Proximity of gas wells to stream channels in a subset of the Fayetteville and Marcellus unconventional natural gas reservoirs. Blue squares represent the areas modeled using GIS in the Fayetteville shale (top; drainage area in 5,809 km²) and the Marcellus shale (bottom; drainage area in 4,041 km²). Maps are example areas that demonstrate differences between the National Hydrography Dataset and modeled drainage area networks.

Figure 3. Simplified diagram of potential threats of natural gas development using coupled horizontal drilling with hydraulic fluid fracturing in unconventional natural gas reservoirs. Exposure pathways that may result in structural and functional alterations to aquatic ecosystems will vary depending on geographic location and rigor of best management practices applied. UIC = underground injection control; TDS=Total dissolved solids; TENORM= technologically enhanced naturally occurring radioactive materials.

Figure 4. Well density and stream turbidity measured in April 2009 during high flows in 7 stream drainages.