1 Mercury concentration and isotopic composition of epiphytic tree lichens in the 2 Alberta Oil Sands Region 3 ¹Blum, JD, ¹Johnson, MW, ¹Gleason, JD, ¹Demers, JD, ²Landis, MS and ³Krupa, S 4 5 6 ¹University of Michigan, Earth and Environmental Sciences, Ann Arbor, MI 48109, USA 7 ²U S EPA, Office of Research and Development, Research Triangle Park, NC 27711, 8 USA 9 ³University of Minnesota, Plant Pathology, St. Paul, MN 55108, USA 10 11 ABSTRACT 12 13 Mercury (Hg) is a toxic heavy metal that is found associated with fossil fuel deposits and that 14 can be released to the atmosphere during fossil fuel combustion and/or processing. Hg 15 emitted to the atmosphere can be deposited to aquatic and terrestrial ecosystems where it can 16 be methylated by bacteria. Methylmercury is strongly biomagnified in food webs and this 17 leads to toxic levels in high trophic level fish, the consumption of which is a major human 18 exposure pathway. Epiphytic tree lichens have been widely used to investigate the 19 relationship between atmospheric point sources of Hg and regional Hg deposition patterns. 20 An intensive study of Hg concentration and stable isotopic composition of the epiphytic tree 21 lichen Hypogymnia physodes was carried out in the area within 150 km of the Alberta oil 22 sands region (AOSR) industrial developments. Concentrations of Hg were comparable to 23 background values measured in previous studies from remote areas and were far below 24 values observed near significant atmospheric industrial sources of Hg. Spatial patterns 25 provide no evidence for a significant atmospheric point source of Hg from the oil sands 26 developments and Hg accumulation actually decreases in lichens within 25 km of the 27 AOSR development, presumably due to physiological responses of Hypogymnia physodes 28 to enhanced SO₂ deposition. Stable mercury isotope ratios show an increase in • ¹⁹⁹Hg and \cdot ²⁰¹Hg within 25 km of the AOSR and we speculate that this is due to a change in 29 30 the proportion of the various ligands to which Hg is bonded in the lichens, and a resulting 31 change in the isotope fractionation during partial photochemical reduction and loss of Hg 32 from lichen surfaces. 33 34 35 **INTRODUCTION**

36

37 Mercury (Hg) is a highly toxic and globally distributed atmospheric trace 38 pollutant. It is released to the atmosphere from a range of industrial activities primarily as 39 gaseous elemental mercury (Hg(0)) and reactive gaseous mercury (Hg(II)). Hg(0) has a 40 long atmospheric residence time (~1 year) and can travel long distances before being 41 oxidized to Hg(II) and deposited (Schroeder and Munthe 1998). Hg(II) has a much 42 shorter residence time than Hg(0) and is rapidly deposited locally in precipitation and dry 43 deposition downwind of atmospheric point sources (Keeler et al 2006; Sherman et al 44 2012). Once Hg(II) is deposited to aquatic and terrestrial ecosystems it can be methylated 45 by sulfate and iron reducing bacteria producing highly toxic and bioaccumulative 46 methylmercury. Biomagnification of atmospherically deposited mercury can result in the 47 acquisition of high levels of methylmercury in high trophic position fish in remote lakes.

48 Consumption of fish is a major human exposure pathway for methyl mercury, especially49 for indigenous peoples (Chan and Receveur 2000).

50

51 Mercury bonds strongly to marine and terrestrial organic matter and is often 52 associated with organic-rich geological deposits. The most important anthropogenic 53 source of Hg to the atmosphere is through the burning of coal (Pirrone et al 2010). 54 However, natural gas processing (Spiri• and Mashyanov 2000) and oil refining (Wilhelm 55 2001) can also produce significant emissions of mercury. Although detailed studies have 56 not been conducted previously, several studies have inferred that AOSR processing may 57 result in enhanced atmospheric Hg emissions (Wilhelm 2000; Kelly et al 2010; Timony 58 and Lee 2009) and that Hg is methylated and bioaccumulated resulting in elevated levels 59 in fish in the region (Timony and Lee 2009). A study by Kelly et al. (2010) also reported 60 that mercury, along with other trace metals, was elevated in snow near the AOSR 61 developments.

62

63 There is a great need for monitoring of Hg deposition spatially near potential 64 atmospheric point sources. Monitoring is particularly difficult in remote areas such as the 65 Alberta oil sands region (AOSR) where atmospheric concentrations and deposition rates 66 are difficult to measure due to lack of road access and electrical power needed to run 67 atmospheric monitoring sites. The industrial development of the AOSR north of Fort 68 McMurray, Alberta, Canada, has resulted in increases in some industrial atmospheric 69 emissions in the region (Percy et al, this volume). The present study was designed to use 70 a single species of naturally occurring tree lichens to evaluate if Hg deposition in the 71 region close to the AOSR was enhanced relative to background values further from the 72 AOSR developments.

73

74 Many different species of epiphytic tree lichen have been used previously as 75 passive collectors of a variety of atmospheric pollutants (e.g., Purvis and Halls 1996), 76 including mercury (e.g., Bargagli and Barghigiani 1991). Physiological differences 77 between lichen species result in differing metal accumulation properties, and so we 78 focused our study on a single species of epiphytic lichen, *Hypogymnia physodes*, that is 79 widely distributed in the AOSR and that has been used extensively in previous studies of 80 Hg deposition in other geographic regions (e.g., Makholm and Bennett 1998, Horvat et al 81 2000). Mercury was measured in the same lichen samples used for major and trace 82 elements analyses (Edgerton et al, this volume) and Pb isotope studies (Graney et al, this 83 volume). A gridded circular sampling pattern was used to allow the use of Hg and other 84 major and trace elements in receptor modeling and impact assessment (Landis et al, this 85 volume).

86

Some previous studies have analyzed variations in the Hg content of naturally
growing *Hypogymnia physodes* near atmospheric pollution sources (Makholm and
Bennett 1998 and references therein, Horvatt et al 2000, Sensen and Richardson 2002)
and others have transplanted *Hypogymnia physodes* with low natural Hg concentrations
to locations near atmospheric point sources and monitored changes in Hg concentration
with time (Makholm and Bennett 1998 and references therein, Horvatt et al 2000,
Bialonska and Dayan 2005, Williamson et al 2008). Additionally, studies have been

- 94 carried out on the organic compounds produced by *Hypogymnia physodes* and their effect
- 95 on metal binding in this species of lichen (Bialonska and Dayan 2005, Hauck and Huneck
- 96 2007, Hauck 2008). Collectively, these studies have shown that Hg concentrations in
- 97 lichen increase near atmospheric point sources for Hg, and that *Hypogymnia physodes*, as
- well as other epiphytic lichens, can provide a useful semi-quantitative proxy for
- atmospheric Hg deposition.
- 100

101 In addition to the many studies that have measured Hg concentrations in epiphytic 102 lichens, two previous studies explored variations in the stable isotopic composition of Hg 103 in epiphytic lichens; but in species other than *Hypogymnia physodes*. Carignan et al 104 (2009) and Estrade et al (2010) measured Hg concentrations and isotopic compositions of 105 four tree lichen species (Usnea, Ramalinia, Evernia and Bryoria) from remote areas in 106 Canada and Switzerland and rural and urban areas in France. They did not find a 107 correlation between Hg concentration and that of other heavy metals (Cd and Pb) but they 108 did document mass independent isotope anomalies in the odd mass Hg isotopes for all 109 lichens sampled. Furthermore, these studies observed decreased mass independent Hg 110 isotope anomalies near industrial atmospheric sources of Hg, and suggested that this was 111 the result of additions of local anthropogenic Hg.

112

113 In this study, we measured total Hg concentrations (n=121) and stable isotopic 114 composition (n=38) in *Hypogymnia physodes* collected in 2008 from trees at proximal 115 and remote sites in a nested circular grid pattern distributed over 0.5 to 150 km from the 116 AOSR industrial complex north of Fort McMurray, Alberta, Canada (see Edgerton et al., 117 this volume). Spatial trends in Hg concentration and isotopic composition are used to 118 evaluate the extent to which the AOSR developments have affected atmospheric Hg 119 deposition. Hg concentrations and isotopic compositions are compared to values from the 120 literature for measurements made in remote areas and near known point sources of Hg. 121 Hg isotopic compositions are also compared to values measured from a variety of 122 geological materials from the AOSR developments and nearby areas.

- 123 124
- 125 METHODS
- 126

127 Sample Collection and Preparation

128 129 A detailed field-sampling program was implemented during August-September 2008. 130 Most sites were accessed by helicopter and others were visited by ground. At each site, 131 composite samples of the lichen *Hypogymnia physodes* were collected from the branches 132 of 6 trees within Jack Pine (Pinus banksiana) tree stands. Samples were stored in 133 polyester sample bags and air dried in a laboratory at the University of Minnesota. Using 134 Teflon coated tweezers, tissue samples were cleaned by removing all foreign materials 135 (bark and other debris) and were then stored frozen until analysis. GPS location data for 136 all sample collection sites were used to determine the distance from a midpoint located at 137 the center of the AORS industrial operations (Edgerton et al., this volume). In 2009 bulk 138 geological samples of oil sands, bitumen, processed tailing sand, overburden, and mine 139 road material were acquired from active mining and energy processing operations in the

140 AOSR. Bulk samples of other undeveloped oil sand deposits exposed in outcrop in the

- 141 Athabasca River valley north of the AOSR industrial developments were also obtained. 142
- All samples were shipped to the University of Michigan where they were freeze-dried,

143 and ground to a powder. Lichen samples were ground in a ball mill (Spex 8000M) using 144 a zirconium grinding vial and balls that were thoroughly cleaned between each sample.

145 Geological materials were ground by hand in an agate mortar and pestle that was

146 thoroughly cleaned between each sample. An \sim 50 mg aliquot of each powdered sample

147 was used for Hg concentration analysis and a 500 mg to 4 g aliquot of a sub-set of the

- 148 samples was used for Hg stable isotope analysis.
- 149

150 Hg Concentration Analysis

151

152 Mercury concentrations were measured using quality control methods that 153 included analysis of analytical standards, procedural blanks and replicate samples. 154 Lichens and geologic samples were analyzed for total Hg concentration by combustion at 155 850°C and quantification by cold-vapor atomic absorption spectrometry (CVAAS; MA-156 2000, Nippon Instruments). Replicate analyses agreed within $\pm 7\%$ and the reporting limit 157 was 0.5 ng Hg. The IRMM powdered lichen reference material BCR482 was run with 158 each batch of eight samples and we obtained an average Hg concentration of 454 ± 8 ng/g 159 (1sd, n=19), which is within 5% of the certified value of 480 ± 20 ng/g.

160

161 Sample Preparation for Isotope Analysis

162

163 Hg was separated for isotopic analysis from lichens and geologic samples by 164 combustion at 750°C, thermal decomposition at 1000°C, and inline trapping in a 1% 165 KMnO₄ solution. To further purify Hg in the KMnO₄ solutions, the solutions were 166 reduced with SnCl₂, purged with Hg-free air, and re-trapped in another 1% KMnO₄ 167 solution. The Hg concentration of each of the KMnO₄ solutions was measured to 168 determine recoveries, and to allow matching of standard and sample concentrations for 169 isotope analysis. Details of the method are given in Biswas et al (2008) and Demers et al. 170 (2012). Mean recovery following combustion for IRMM lichen reference material 171 BCR482 was 94% (\pm 4%, 1SD, n = 5), and mean recovery following both combustion 172 and secondary purge and trap of BCR482 was 93% (\pm 3%, 1SD, n = 5).

- 173
- 174 Mass Spectrometry
- 175

176 Mercury in KMnO₄ solutions separated from lichens and bulk geologic samples 177 was analyzed for isotopic composition with a multiple collector inductively coupled 178 plasma mass spectrometer (MC-ICP-MS; Nu Instruments) using continuous flow cold 179 vapor generation with SnCl₂ reduction (Lauretta et al 2001, Blum and Bergquist 2007). 180 Instrumental mass bias was corrected using an internal Tl standard (NIST SRM 997, ²⁰⁵Tl/²⁰³Tl=2.38714) and sample-standard bracketing with the NIST SRM 3133 Hg 181 182 standard. Analyses and standards were run at 5 ppb Hg. On-peak zero corrections were applied to all masses and isobaric interference from ²⁰⁴Pb was monitored using mass 206, 183 184 but was always negligible.

- 188
- 189 190

199

200

203

• ^{xxx}Hg (‰) = [(^{xxx}Hg/¹⁹⁸Hg)_{unknown} / (^{xxx}Hg/¹⁹⁸Hg)_{NIST SRM 3133}) - 1] * 1000 (1)

We report isotopic compositions as permil (‰) deviations from the average of

where xxx is the mass of each mercury isotope between ¹⁹⁹Hg and ²⁰⁴Hg. We use \cdot^{202} Hg to describe isotopic differences due to mass dependent fractionation (MDF). Mass independent fractionation (MIF) is defined as the deviation of the isotope ratios involving odd mass isotopes from the theoretically expected values determined by the kinetic massdependent fractionation law based on the measured \cdot^{202} Hg (Blum and Bergquist 2007). MIF is reported in "capital delta" notation (\cdot^{xxx} Hg) in units of permil (‰), and is well approximated for small ranges in delta values (\cdot 10 ‰) by equation 2:

NIST SRM 3133 bracketing standards using delta notation following equation 1:

where xxx is the mass of each Hg isotope 199 and 201 and • is a constant (0.252 and
0.752, respectively; Blum and Bergquist 2007).

204 Analytical Uncertainty205

206 The uncertainty of Hg isotope measurements was characterized using a secondary 207 standard solution that is widely distributed (UM-Almaden) and an international lichen 208 reference material (BCR482). The UM-Almaden standard solution is useful for inter-209 laboratory comparison and we obtained the following values for 10 replicate analyses carried out during the analyses of samples for this study: δ^{202} Hg=-0.59±0.03‰(2sd), 210 • 199 Hg=-0.01±0.04‰(2sd), • 201 Hg=-0.04±0.03‰(2sd). The lichen IRMM BCR482 is 211 useful for assessment of the uncertainty of complete Hg separation and analyses and we 212 213 obtained the following values for 6 replicate analyses carried out during the analyses of samples for this study: δ^{202} Hg=-1.67±0.04‰(2sd), • ¹⁹⁹Hg=-0.67±0.04‰(2sd) and 214 • 201 Hg=-0.68±0.03‰(2sd). 215

- 216 217
- 218 RESULTS AND DISCUSSION
- 219

Hg concentrations of Hypogymnia physodes

220 221

222 Total Hg concentrations for the 121 *Hypogymnia physodes* samples analyzed 223 ranged from 71 to 268 ng/g with a mean value of 144 ± 33 ng/g (1sd) (Figure 1). These 224 values are in the range typical for remote areas unaffected by point source Hg emissions. 225 Makholm and Bennett (1998) reported background Hg concentrations for Hypogymnia 226 physodes in northern Wisconsin of 110 to 155 ng/g and Bennett and Wetmore (1997) 227 reported background values of 103 to 143 ng/g for northern Minnesota. Makholm and 228 Bennett (1998, and references within) compiled background Hg concentration values for 229 European studies as of 1998 and reported that most values (9 separate studies) ranged 230 from 200 to 400 ng/g, whereas two studies in Scandanavia reported background values of 231 100 ng/g and 160 ng/g respectively. Since 1998 two additional studies measured

(2)

232 background Hg values in *Hypogymnia physodes*. Horvat (2000) measured a mean

- 233 background value of 110±10 ng/g at a remote location in Slovenia and Sensen and
- 234 Richardson (2002) measured a mean background Hg value of 148±46 ng/g at a remote
- 235 location in New Brunswick, Canada. Altogether, comparison of the values reported here
- 236 for Hg in *Hypogymnia physodes* in the AOSR are consistent with background values
- 237 measured in a large number of studies of Hg in *Hypogymnia physodes* in both North 238 America and Europe. This suggests that any Hg deposition associated with the AOSR
- 239 development has not significantly elevated the Hg concentrations in lichens.
- 240

241 Previous studies have shown that Hg concentrations in natural Hypogymnia 242 physodes collected near atmospheric Hg point sources, and Hg in Hypogymnia physodes 243 transplanted to the vicinity of Hg point sources, have lichen tissue concentrations much 244 higher than those that we measured in the AOSR. Makholm and Bennett (1998) 245 transplanted Hypogymnia physodes downwind of a chlor-alkali plant and after a year of 246 exposure concentrations ranged up to 4418 ng/g at a distance of 250 m from the plant and 247 up to 403 ng/g at a distance of 1250 m. Makholm and Bennett (1998, and references 248 therein) also compiled the results of earlier studies of Hg in *Hypogymnia physodes* near 249 point sources and found that in each of seven studies Hg concentrations were highly 250 elevated near the source with values ranging from 770 to 36000 ng/g. In a more recent 251 study, Horvat et al (2000) transplanted Hypogymnia physodes to locations around a 252 natural gas treatment plant in Molve, Croatia and locations around a Hg mining area in 253 Idrija, Slovenia, where measurements of the concentration of ambient total gaseous 254 mercury (TGM) in air were also made. They found a strong correlation between the 255 logarithm of the total Hg concentration in *Hypogymnia physodes* and the logarithm of the 256 TGM concentration in air. Hg concentrations in *Hypogymnia physodes* were 110 ng/g at 257 the time of transplant and ranged from 540 to 4430 ng/g after 6 months in the mining 258 area. In another recent study Senson and Richardson (2002) analyzed Hg in naturally 259 growing *Hypogymnia physodes* on spruce trees along transects near a Hg cell chlor-alkali 260 plant in New Brunswick, Canada. They documented systematic increases in Hg 261 concentration from a background value of 148 ng/g at a distance of 8 km from the plant 262 to maximum value of 790 and 980 ng/g at a distance of 125 m along two different 263 transects. In sum, these studies show that within about 1 to 8 km of atmospheric Hg point 264 sources the Hg concentrations of Hypogymnia physodes are generally elevated far above 265 background values. This reinforces our conclusion that the AOSR development is not a 266 significant atmospheric Hg source that is detectable using lichen analysis and certainly 267 does not generate atmospheric Hg levels near the magnitude of chor-alkali plants, 268 smelters, gas processing plants, or Hg mining areas that have been studied previously.

- 269
- 270 271

Hg concentrations of other species of epiphytic lichen

272 The literature is rich with investigations that have used epiphytic lichens other 273 than *Hypogymnia physodes* to study Hg levels in the atmosphere. Because of 274 physiological differences between species it is not advisable to directly compare metal 275 concentrations between species. Nevertheless, these studies do confirm that for most 276 species a concentration range of 100-200 ng/g total Hg is a common background 277 concentration that is often observed in remote areas. Large increases in Hg

278 concentrations are often observed within about 8 km of large atmospheric Hg point 279 sources, and lichen Hg concentrations generally correlate with TGM concentrations in air 280 (Bargagli and Barghigiani 1991; Guevara et al 2004; Grangeon et al 2012; Tretiach et al 281 2011). Using four different lichen species (but not including *Hypogymnia physodes*) 282 Landers et al (1995) observed increased Hg concentrations in Alaska with closer 283 proximity to the marine coastline. Carignan and Sonke (2010) measured Hg in three 284 lichen species (but again not in *Hypogymnia physodes*) in Canada (mostly in Quebec) and 285 found that Hg concentrations were well correlated with Br concentrations, and that both 286 elements increased in concentration with decreasing distance to Hudson Bay. These 287 authors attributed the spatial trends to a marine source of Br to the atmosphere, which is 288 known to oxidize background Hg(0) in the atmosphere, which then led to increased 289 deposition of Hg(II). The Carignan and Sonke (2010) study documents lichen Hg 290 concentrations as high as 2060 ng/g in the lichen species Bryoria, 20 km from Hudson 291 Bay but far from anthropogenic point sources. Hg concentrations dropped below 250 292 ng/g at distances greater than 800 km from Hudson Bay. The AOSR is about 800 km 293 from both the Pacific Ocean and Hudson Bay and appears to be unaffected by this Hg 294 deposition mechanism.

- 295
- 296
- 297

5 Spatial Variation in Hg concentrations of *Hypogymnia physodes*

298 In order to explore whether the observed variability in the Hg concentration of 299 *Hypogymnia physodes* in the vicinity of the AOSR is affected by the mining and energy 300 production activities, we plotted the Hg concentrations of lichens as a function of the 301 distance from the center of the production area (Figure 1). Regression of the data reveals 302 a small (slope=0.33 ng/g per km) but significant (p=0.0002) decrease in the Hg 303 concentration of lichens as the active mining and upgrading facilities are approached. The 304 regression line drops from a Hg concentration of 171 ng/g at 155 km to 122 ng/g at 5 km. 305 This behavior is the opposite of what has been documented in the literature near 306 atmospheric point sources of Hg and is (as far as we are aware) the first documentation of 307 decreasing Hg concentration in lichen as an industrial development is approached. We do 308 note, however, that previous studies documenting increases in the Hg concentration of 309 *Hypogymnia physodes* in the vicinity of atmospheric Hg sources, found elevated Hg in 310 lichens only at distances of 8 km or less from the sources. The sampling distances in our 311 study were generally much farther from the potential source than previous studies, and 312 only 8 of the 121 Hypogymnia physodes samples were from 8 km or less distance from 313 the center of the AOSR mining and energy production areas. However, even these 314 samples within close proximity of the AOSR industrial development did not have 315 elevated Hg concentrations.

316

Although a decrease in Hg in epiphytic lichens near industrial facilities has not
been previously reported, a study comparing naturally growing and transplanted *Hypogymnia physodes* within a km of a chlor-alkali plant in Norway may provide some
insight into this phenomenon. Steinnes and Krog (1977) found that Hg concentrations in
naturally occurring *Hypogymnia physodes* reached a maximum of 950 ng/g in close
proximity to a chlor-alkali plant. However, when they transplanted *Hypogymnia physodes*from a remote site to the industrial site they observed an increase in Hg content with time

324 and found Hg concentrations in Hypogymnia physodes as high as 6000 to 8000 ng/g after 325 16 weeks of exposure. The authors suggested that the lower uptake of Hg by the naturally 326 occurring lichens compared to the transplants may have been related to SO_2 exposure and 327 resulting loss of vigor in the Hypogymnia physodes (Steinnes and Krog 1977). In the 328 vicinity of the AOSR the sulfur content of *Hypogymnia physodes* is higher due to SO_2 329 deposition (Edgerton et al, Landis et al, this volume) and we suggest that this may have 330 resulted in decreased Hg accumulation as suggested in the study of Steinnes and Krog 331 (1977). Graney et al (this volume) observed a subtle decrease in Zn and Mn 332 concentrations toward the center of the AOSR region in the same lichen samples we 333 analyzed. They suggested that this trend may be related to canopy interactions or 334 physiological processes in the lichens.

- 335
- 336
- 337

Hg Isotopic composition of Hypogymnia physodes 338

339 A subset of 38 Hypogymnia physodes samples that were analyzed for Hg 340 concentration were also analyzed for their stable mercury isotopic composition. 341 Variations in the isotopic composition related to mass dependent fractionation of Hg are reported as δ^{202} Hg and samples ranged in values from -2.66 to -1.41‰ with an average 342 343 value of $-1.87 \pm 0.22\%$ (1sd) (Figure 2). Mass independent fractionation (MIF) is reported here as \cdot ¹⁹⁹Hg (but note that \cdot ²⁰¹Hg shows the same behavior) and samples 344 345 ranged in values from -0.55 to +0.33% with an average value of -0.24 $\pm 0.17\%$ (1sd) (Figure 3). The ratio of \bullet ¹⁹⁹Hg/ \bullet ²⁰¹Hg is 0.997 (Figure 4), suggesting that the MIF 346 results from photochemical reduction of Hg(II) to Hg(0) involving short-lived radical pair 347 348 reactions and is caused by the magnetic isotope effect (Bergquist and Blum 2007; Blum 349 2011).

350

351 Two other investigations of Hg isotopic compositions of lichens have been 352 published previously, but there have been no previous Hg isotopic studies of the lichen 353 species *Hypogymnia physodes*. Carignan et al. (2009) and Estrade et al. (2010) measured 354 Hg isotope values in remote areas in Canada and Switzerland and both urban and 355 industrial areas in France in many different lichen species. These lichens ranged widely in δ^{202} Hg values from 1.5 down to -2.2‰. The lichens analyzed in these previous studies also displayed negative values for • ¹⁹⁹Hg (and • ²⁰¹Hg), with values ranging from -0.2 to 356 357 -0.9‰. Lichens from remote areas showed the lowest •¹⁹⁹Hg values (Carignan et al 358 359 2009) and values tended to become less negative in urban and industrial areas (Estrade et 360 al 2010). At that time these authors interpreted the negative • ¹⁹⁹Hg values to be indicative of regional atmospheric Hg isotopic values and the increase in •¹⁹⁹Hg near 361 362 industrial areas as the impact of adding industrial point sources of Hg that had near-zero • ¹⁹⁹Hg values. 363

364

More recently, several studies of atmospheric Hg isotopes have shown that Hg(II) 365 deposited from the atmosphere in precipitation has positive 199 Hg (and 201 Hg) values, 366 and that gaseous Hg(0) in the atmosphere has negative • 199 Hg (and • 201 Hg) values. 367 Furthermore, these studies have demonstrated that there are fractionation mechanisms 368 that can cause Hg with more positive • ¹⁹⁹Hg to be released from surfaces following 369

- photochemical reduction of Hg(II) to Hg(0) (Gratz et al 2010; Sherman et al 2010, 2012;
- 371 Demers et al 2012). In a recent investigation of Hg isotope systematics in a forested
- ecosystem in northern Wisconsin (USA), Demers et al (2012) found that gaseous
- elemental Hg(0) with \bullet ¹⁹⁹Hg of -0.2‰ is oxidized and deposited to tree leaf surfaces, and that subsequent photochemical reduction and loss of a portion of this Hg results in
- increasingly negative values for ¹⁹⁹Hg in leaves, averaging about –0.3‰. This same Hg
 isotope fractionation process may occur on lichen surfaces as well as on leaves. We
- suggest that Hg(0) is deposited to lichen surfaces, becoming oxidized to Hg(II) as it binds with ligands in organic acids. Photochemical reactions then cause partial reduction and loss of some Hg(II) as Hg(0) with more positive • ¹⁹⁹Hg, and the Hg(II) that remains in
- 380 the lichen acquires more negative \cdot ¹⁹⁹Hg values.
- 381 382

Spatial Variation in Hg Isotopic composition of Hypogymnia physodes

The δ^{202} Hg values of the lichens from this study are plotted versus distance from the active mining and energy production activities on Figure 2. δ^{202} Hg values do not vary significantly with distance (p = 0.350) from the active energy production areas and are similar to values for foliage from trees in northern Wisconsin (USA) measured by Demers et al (2012). Values are unaffected by proximity to the AOSR developments, as would be expected, because Hg concentrations show no evidence for addition of Hg from this source.

391

In contrast, • 199 Hg (and • 201 Hg) values shift dramatically with distance from the 392 AOSR development (Figure 3). At distances of >25 km the average • ¹⁹⁹Hg value is 393 -0.38 \pm 0.07‰ whereas at <25 km the average • ¹⁹⁹Hg value is -0.13 \pm 0.15‰ and reaches a 394 maximum value of +0.33%. The dramatic increase in • ¹⁹⁹Hg values combined with the 395 396 decrease in Hg concentrations of Hypogymnia physodes near the AOSR development is 397 somewhat puzzling. It appears that either i) the AOSR development is emitting Hg with 398 very high • ¹⁹⁹Hg values, but accumulation of Hg in the lichens near the AOSR is 399 suppressed to the point that Hg concentrations actually appear to decrease near the active 400 energy production areas or ii) there are physiological effects in the lichens near the active 401 energy production areas due to deposition of other pollutants (in particular SO_2) that both 402 suppresses Hg accumulation and alters the mass independent fractionation of Hg on lichen surfaces resulting in an increase in • ¹⁹⁹Hg values. Each of these alternate 403 404 explanations is discussed in more detail below.

405

406 *Hg isotopic composition of Oil Sands Materials*

407

To explore the possibility that the AOSR development is emitting Hg with highly 408 elevated • ¹⁹⁹Hg values, and that this is responsible for the high • ¹⁹⁹Hg values in lichens 409 410 in close proximity to the AOSR, we analyzed bulk samples of geological materials from 411 the AOSR (see Landis et al, this volume). Oil sand, bitumen, processed tailings sand, 412 overburden and road materials from mines between Ft McMurray and Ft McKay were 413 analyzed. Weathered oil sand that naturally outcrops along the Athabasca River north of 414 Fort McKay (and has not been mined) was also analyzed. The concentration of Hg in the 415 oil sands ranged from 4.1 to 38.8 ng/g, processed sands from tailings ranged from 1.9 to

10.6 ng/g, and the bitumen, overburden and road material were 14.3, 13.1 and 32.8 ng/g,
respectively. In comparison, Hg concentrations are 3.5 ng/g in mean volume weighted
US crude oil and 100 ng/g in mean volume weighted US coal (Wilhelm et al 2007;
Toole-O'Neil et al 1999). The mean background Hg concentration for lake sediments in
Alberta was recently reported as 36 ng/g (Nasr et al 2011), and indicates that the oil sands
and associated materials do not have Hg concentrations that are far above background
sediment concentrations.

423

• ¹⁹⁹Hg and δ^{202} Hg values of the geologic materials analyzed are plotted along 424 425 with values for the lichens on Figure 5. Oil sand, bitumen, processed sand and 426 overburden from mines between Fort McMurray and Fort McKay fall in a narrow range 427 of Hg isotope values that overlap with values for *Hypogymnia physodes* collected >25 km from the mines, but have lower • ¹⁹⁹Hg and higher δ^{202} Hg than Hypogymnia physodes 428 429 collected <25 km from the mines. A single sample of road material from the mines has 430 • 199 Hg ~0.3‰ higher than the other mine samples and could possibly represent addition of Hg from oil, brake pads or diesel fuel. The three samples of oil sand from the 431 Athabasca River north of Fort McKay also have \cdot ¹⁹⁹Hg values about ~0.3‰ higher than the mine samples. These samples have \cdot ¹⁹⁹Hg closer to the values of the *Hypogymnia* 432 433 *physodes* <25 km from the mines, and δ^{202} Hg values about ~0.5‰ higher, but these 434 435 deposits are not currently mined or processed.

436

437 Potential Hg sources from the mining operations are similar to the background 438 isotopic values in lichens >25 km from the mining areas. Therefore, addition of this 439 potential source of Hg would not shift the lichen Hg isotopic values appreciably. Even if all of the Hg in the lichens near the AOSR had the maximum observed • ¹⁹⁹Hg from the 440 441 undeveloped Athabasca River oil sand, this could only explain the lichens with 442 intermediate values and could not explain the highest lichen • ¹⁹⁹Hg values. Therefore, we can rule out addition of oil sand-derived Hg as the sole cause for the increase in • ¹⁹⁹Hg 443 444 values of *Hypogymnia physodes* within 25 km of the AOSR area.

- 445
- 446
- 447 448

Proposed mechanism to explain Hg isotopic variability

449 We have argued above that the addition of Hg from the active mining and energy 450 production activities does not adequately explain the changes in Hg isotopic composition 451 observed in lichens within 25 km of the AOSR. Furthermore, the observed lower Hg 452 concentrations in lichens near the AOSR are not consistent with addition of Hg from a 453 point source to the regional background. We suggest that the increase in • ¹⁹⁹Hg values of 454 *Hypogymnia physodes* within 25 km of the AOSR is caused by a change in the processes 455 by which *Hypogymnia physodes* binds Hg (II) species onto ligands present in the lichens. 456 Following deposition of Hg to the lichens, there appears to be a change in the reaction 457 pathway and degree of photochemical reduction of Hg (II) from the lichen surfaces. This 458 reduction in the loss of Hg(0) from the lichen surfaces appears to result in a change in the lichen • ¹⁹⁹Hg values. 459

461 Experimental studies of Hg isotope fractionation have shown that large magnitude 462 mass independent fractionation (>0.2%) is generally the result of photochemical reactions involving short-lived radical pairs (Blum 2011). The ratio of • ¹⁹⁹Hg to • ²⁰¹Hg 463 464 and the observation of either the preferential loss or gain of odd isotopes of Hg in 465 volatilized Hg(0) during reduction, has been shown to be related to the ligands to which Hg is bonded (Zheng and Hintelmann 2010). Regression of •¹⁹⁹Hg versus •²⁰¹Hg for 466 lichens from this study yield a slope of 0.997 ($r^2 = 0.947$; Figure 4) and values are 467 468 negative (meaning odd isotopes were preferentially lost). Hg (II) is known to be 469 photochemically reduced to Hg(0) and emitted from leaf surfaces (Mowat et al 2011). 470 Zheng and Hintelmann (2010) showed that when Hg (II) is bonded to a sulfur-containing 471 ligand photochemical reduction and loss of Hg(0) from aqueous solutions results in residual Hg(II) with negative • ¹⁹⁹Hg and • ²⁰¹Hg. When the binding ligand is sulfurless, residual Hg(II) is observed to have positive • ¹⁹⁹Hg and • ²⁰¹Hg. 472 473

474

475 Lichens are known to produce a wide range of organic ligands, both containing 476 and not containing sulfur, that play an important role in metal binding. Both intracellular 477 binding of metals to sulfur-containing peptides (metallothioneins) and extracellular 478 binding to sulfur-less organic acids is known to occur in lichens (Sarret et al, 1998). 479 Although experiments exploring Hg isotope fractionation in the presence of these ligands 480 have not yet been performed, we would expect that both positive and negative MIF could 481 be produced by photochemical reduction of Hg(II) complexed with these various 482 compounds. It seems likely that the net isotopic composition of lichen is the result of 483 simultaneous negative and positive mass independent fractionation of Hg associated with 484 different bonding environments in the lichen. Given this assumption, we suggest that 485 *Hypogymnia physodes* collected >25 km from the active mining and energy production facilities have negative \cdot ¹⁹⁹Hg and \cdot ²⁰¹Hg that resulted from the dominance of 486 photochemical reduction of Hg(II) from sulfur-bearing ligands compared to sulfur-less 487 ligands. The increase in \bullet ¹⁹⁹Hg and \bullet ²⁰¹Hg that is observed closer to the active mining 488 489 and energy production facilities could then be interpreted as a shift in the balance toward 490 reduction of Hg(II) from sulfur-less ligands.

491

492 A study by Bialonska and Dayan (2005) measured changes in the production of 493 organic acids by samples of *Hypogymnia physodes* when they were transplanted to four 494 different sites where they were exposed to industrial emissions of metals and SO₂. Site-495 specific changes in production of various organic acids was observed, with some 496 increasing and others decreasing with exposure. For example, an increase in the content 497 of physodic acid was observed in all transplanted lichens and the authors suggested a 498 possible role for this compound in defense against stress caused by exposure to pollutants 499 (Bialonska and Dayan 2005). Although highly speculative, we suggest that exposure of Hvpogymnia physodes in the AOSR near active mining and energy production facilities 500 501 to SO_2 and other metals could have changed the balance of the various organic acids 502 produced in the lichens. Increased complexation of Hg(II) to these sulfur-less compounds, with resulting enhanced photochemical reduction of Hg and loss back to the 503 atmosphere, is a possible explanation for both the increase in \cdot ¹⁹⁹Hg and \cdot ²⁰¹Hg and 504 decrease in total Hg concentration observed in the lichens <25 km from the mining and 505 506 energy production facilities.

510

509 CONCLUSIONS

511 A single species of epiphytic tree lichen (*Hypogymnia physodes*) was sampled in 512 2008 at remote sites in a nested, circular grid pattern 0.5 to 150 km from the center of 513 industrial development in the Alberta Oil Sands Region north of Fort McMurray, Alberta, 514 Canada. Total Hg concentrations in epiphytic lichens have been used in previous studies 515 as a measure of spatial variations in atmospheric Hg deposition and to delineate the near 516 field influence of atmospheric point sources of Hg. The stable Hg isotopic composition 517 has also recently been used as a monitor of additions of local anthropogenic Hg to 518 regional background deposition. Hg concentrations in *Hypogymnia physodes* in the 519 AOSR ranged from 71 to 268 ng/g, which is similar to that measured by others for 520 remote sites in other regions. Based on concentration alone there is no evidence for 521 anomalously high atmospheric Hg deposition near the AOSR mining and energy 522 production facilities. In fact, small variations with distance show that Hg concentrations 523 decrease with proximity to the facilities. This conclusion is in contrast with the finding of 524 Kelly et al (2010) who observed increased Hg concentrations in snow near the AOSR 525 energy development facilities.

526

527 The stable Hg isotope composition of the lichens does, however, change systematically with distance from the potential industrial sources. Most notably the 528 lichens display varying levels of mass independent fractionation with both • ¹⁹⁹Hg and 529 530 • ²⁰¹Hg ranging from near 0.0‰ close to the oil sands developments and systematically falling to -0.4% about 25 km away. The \cdot ¹⁹⁹Hg/ \cdot ²⁰¹Hg slope is close to one, suggesting 531 532 that the mass independent fractionation results from photochemical reduction of Hg(II) to 533 Hg(0). Mass dependent fractionation does not change systematically with distance from the oil sands developments, and δ^{202} Hg averages -1.9‰. The spatial trends show that the energy production activities influence the • ¹⁹⁹Hg and • ²⁰¹Hg values without significantly 534 535 affecting the δ^{202} Hg values and have the effect of lowering the Hg concentrations of the 536 lichens. Measurements of the Hg isotopic composition of the oils sands themselves show 537 538 that they cannot explain the variation in Hg isotopic composition of *Hypogymnia* 539 *physodes* near the energy production facilities. It is possible that other atmospheric 540 pollutants, such as SO_2 (which is known to affect the vitality of lichens), are influencing 541 Hg retention in the lichens. *Hypogymnia physodes* is also known to respond to SO_2 by 542 changing its production of organic acids. This may affect the proportions of different 543 ligands to which Hg is bonded, thus influencing the photochemical reduction of Hg on 544 lichen surfaces, which we suggest is the cause of the observed mass independent 545 fractionation.

546

547 ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

548

549 We wish to thank Shanti Berryman and Justin Straker for their efforts in sample
550 collection and cleaning. Sarah North and Elaina Shope provided assistance in the
1aboratory. This work was funded by the Wood Buffalo Environmental Association

(WBEA). The content and opinions expressed by the authors in this report do not 553 necessarily reflect the views of the WBEA or of the WBEA membership.

554

555 REFERENCES

557	Bargagli, R., Barghigiani, C., 1991. Lichen Biomonitoring of Mercury Emission and Deposition
558	in Mining, Geothermal and Volcanic Areas of Italy. Environmental Monitoring and
559	Assessment, 16(3): 265-275.

- 560 Bennett, J.P., Wetmore, C.M., 1997. Chemical element concentrations in four lichens on a 561 transect entering Voyageurs-National Park. Environmental and Experimental Botany, 562 37(2-3): 173-185.
- 563 Bergquist, B.A., Blum, J.D., 2007. Mass-dependent and -independent fractionation of Hg 564 isotopes by photoreduction in aquatic systems. Science, 318(5849): 417-420.
- 565 Bialonska, D., Dayan, F.E., 2005. Chemistry of the lichen Hypogymnia physodes transplanted to 566 an industrial region. Journal of Chemical Ecology, 31(12): 2975-2991.
- 567 Biswas, A., Blum, J.D., Bergquist, B.A., Keeler, G.J., Xie, Z.Q., 2008. Natural Mercury Isotope 568 Variation in Coal Deposits and Organic Soils. Environmental Science & Technology, 569 42(22): 8303-8309.
- 570 Blum, J.D., 2011. Applications of Stable Mercury Isotopes to Biogeochemistry. In: Baskaran, M. 571 (Ed.), Handbook of Environmental Isotope Geochemistry. Springer, pp. 229-246.
- 572 Blum, J.D., Bergquist, B.A., 2007. Reporting of variations in the natural isotopic composition of 573 mercury. Analytical and Bioanalytical Chemistry, 388(2): 353-359.
- 574 Carignan, J., Estrade, N., Sonke, J.E., Donard, O.F.X., 2009. Odd Isotope Deficits in 575 Atmospheric Hg Measured in Lichens. Environmental Science & Technology, 43(15): 576 5660-5664.
- 577 Carignan, J., Sonke, J., 2010. The effect of atmospheric mercury depletion events on the net 578 deposition flux around Hudson Bay, Canada. Atmospheric Environment, 44(35): 4372-579 4379.
- 580 Chan, H.M., Receveur, O., 2000. Mercury in the traditional diet of indigenous peoples in 581 Canada. Environmental Pollution, 110(1): 1-2.
- 582 Demers, J.D., Blum, J.D., Zak, D.R., 2012. Mercury isotopes in a forested ecosystem: new 583 insights into biogeochemical cycling and the global mercury cycle. Global 584 Biogeochemical cycles, in review.
- 585 Edgerton, E., this volume.
- 586 Estrade, N., Carignan, J., Donard, O.F.X., 2010. Isotope Tracing of Atmospheric Mercury 587 Sources in an Urban Area of Northeastern France. Environmental Science & Technology, 588 44(16): 6062-6067.
- 589 Graney, J., this volume.
- 590 Grangeon, S., Guedron, S., Asta, J., Sarret, G., Charlet, L., 2012. Lichen and soil as indicators of 591 an atmospheric mercury contamination in the vicinity of a chlor-alkali plant (Grenoble, 592 France). Ecological Indicators, 13(1): 178-183.
- 593 Gratz, L.E., Keeler, G.J., Blum, J.D., Sherman, L.S., 2010. Isotopic Composition and 594 Fractionation of Mercury in Great Lakes Precipitation and Ambient Air. Environmental 595 Science & Technology, 44(20): 7764-7770.
- 596 Guevara, S.R., Bubach, D., Arribere, M., 2004. Mercury in lichens of Nahuel Huapi National 597 Park, Patagonia, Argentina. Journal of Radioanalytical and Nuclear Chemistry, 261(3):

598	679-687.
599	Hauck, M., 2008. Metal homeostasis in Hypogymnia physodes is controlled by lichen
600	substances. Environmental Pollution, 153(2): 304-308.
601	Hauck, M., Huneck, S., 2007. Lichen substances affect metal adsorption in Hypogymnia
602	physodes. Journal of Chemical Ecology, 33(1): 219-223.
603	Horvat, M., Jeran, Z., Spiric, Z., Jacimovic, R., Miklavcic, V., 2000. Mercury and other elements
604	in lichens near the INA Naftaplin gas treatment plant, Molve, Croatia. Journal of
605	Environmental Monitoring, 2(2): 139-144.
606	Keeler, G.J., Landis, M.S., Norris, G.A., Christianson, E.M., Dvonch, J.T., 2006. Sources of
607	mercury wet deposition in Eastern Ohio, USA. Environmental Science & Technology,
608	40(19): 5874-5881.
609	Kelly, E.N. et al., 2010. Oil sands development contributes elements toxic at low concentrations
610	to the Athabasca River and its tributaries. Proceedings of the National Academy of
611	Sciences of the United States of America, 107(37): 16178-16183.
612	Landers, D.H. et al., 1995. Mercury in Vegetation and Lake-Sediments from the Arctic. Water
613	Air and Soil Pollution, 80(1-4): 591-601.
614	Landis, M., this volume.
615	Lauretta, D.S., Klaue, B., Blum, J.D., Buseck, P.R., 2001. Mercury abundances and isotopic
616	compositions in the Murchison (CM) and Allende (CV) carbonaceous chondrites.
617	Geochimica Et Cosmochimica Acta, 65(16): 2807-2818.
618	Makholm, M.M., Bennett, J.P., 1998. Mercury accumulation in transplanted Hypogymnia
619	physodes lichens downwind of Wisconsin chlor-alkali plant. Water Air and Soil
620	Pollution, 102(3-4): 427-436.
621	Mowat, L.D., St Louis, V.L., Graydon, J.A., Lehnherr, I., 2011. Influence of Forest Canopies on
622	the Deposition of Methylmercury to Boreal Ecosystem Watersheds. Environmental
623	Science & Technology, 45(12): 5178-5185.
624	Nasr, M., Ogilvie, J., Castonguay, M., Rencz, A., Arp, P.A., 2011. Total Hg concentrations in
625	stream and lake sediments: Discerning geospatial patterns and controls across Canada.
626	Applied Geochemistry, 26(11): 1818-1831.
627	Percy et al, this volume.
628	Pirrone, N. et al., 2010. Global mercury emissions to the atmosphere from anthropogenic and
629	natural sources. Atmospheric Chemistry and Physics, 10(13): 5951-5964.
630	Purvis, O.W., Halls, C., 1996. A review of lichens in metal-enriched environments.
631	Lichenologist, 28: 571-601.
632	Sarret, G. et al., 1998. Mechanisms of lichen resistance to metallic pollution. Environmental
633	Science & Technology, 32(21): 3325-3330.
634	Schroeder, W.H., Munthe, J., 1998. Atmospheric mercury - An overview. Atmospheric
635	Environment, 32(5): 809-822.
636	Sensen, M., Richardson, D.H.S., 2002. Mercury levels in lichens from different host trees around
637	a chlor-alkali plant in New Brunswick, Canada. Science of the Total Environment, 293(1-
638	3): 31-45.
639	Sherman, L.S. et al., 2010. Mass-independent fractionation of mercury isotopes in Arctic snow
640	driven by sunlight. Nature Geoscience, 3(3): 173-177.
641	Sherman, L.S., Blum, J.D., Keeler, G.J., Demers, J.D., Dvonch, J.T., 2012, Investigation of
642	local mercury deposition from a coal-fired power plant using mercury
643	isotopes. Env. Sci and Tech. 46(1): 382–390.

644	Spiric, Z., Mashyanov, N.R., 2000. Mercury measurements in ambient air near natural gas
645	processing facilities. Fresenius Journal of Analytical Chemistry, 366(5): 429-432.
646	Steinnes, E., Krog, H., 1977. Mercury, Arsenic and Selenium Fallout from an Industrial
647	Complex Studied by Means of Lichen Transplants. Oikos, 28(2-3): 160-164.
648	Timoney, K.P., Lee, P, 2009. Does the Alberta Tar Sands Industry Pollute? The Scientific
649	Evidence. The Open Conservation Biology Journal, 3: 65-81.
650	Toole-O'Neil, B., Tewalt, S.J., Finkelman, R.B., Akers, D.J., 1999, Mercury concentration in
651	coal - unraveling the puzzle. Fuel, $78(1)$: 47-54.
652	Tretiach, M. et al., 2011, Lichen transplants as a suitable tool to identify mercury pollution from
653	waste incinerators: a case study from NE Italy. Environmental Monitoring and
654	Assessment, 175(1-4): 589-600.
655	Wilhelm S.M. Bloom N. 2000 Mercury in petroleum. Fuel Processing Technology, 63(1): 1-
656	27.
657	Wilhelm S.M. Liang L. Cussen D. Kirchgessner, D.A. 2007 Mercury in crude oil processed
658	in the United States (2004) Environmental Science & Technology 41(13): 4509-4514
659	Williamson B I Purvis O W Mikhailova I N Spiro B Udachin V 2008 The lichen
660	transplant methodology in the source apportionment of metal denosition around a copper
661	smelter in the former mining town of Karabash Russia Environmental Monitoring and
662	Assessment 141(1-3): 227-236
663	Zheng W Hintelmann H 2010 Isotone Fractionation of Mercury during Its Photochemical
664	Reduction by Low-Molecular-Weight Organic Compounds Journal of Physical
665	Chemistry A 114(12): 4246-4253
666	Chemistry 11, 11 (12). 1210 (200).
667	
668	
669	FIGURE CAPTIONS
670	
671	Figure 1. The concentration of Hg in lichens (in ng/g) versus the distance of the sample
672	collection point from the center of the energy production activities (in km).
673	
674	Figure 2. The δ^{202} Hg value of Hg in lichens (in permil) versus the distance of the sample
675	collection point from the center of the energy production activities (in km)
676	concetion point from the center of the energy production ded vities (in kin).
677	Figure 3. The Λ^{199} Hg value of Hg in lichens (in permit) versus the distance of the sample
678	collection point from the center of the energy production activities (in km)
670	conection point from the center of the energy production activities (in km).
600	Figure 4. The Λ^{199} Hg value of Hg in lightness (in normal) versus the Λ^{201} Hg value of Hg in
600	Figure 4. The Δ fig value of fig in fictients (in permit) versus the Δ fig value of fig in lichens (in permit)
601	inchens (in perinir).
002	
003	Figure 5. The Δ Hg value of Hg (in permil) versus the δ Hg value of Hg (in permil) in
004	nchens as well as in a variety of geological materials from the AOSK region.
005	
000	
68/	
688	
689	





- Figure 2.
 - 0.00 -0.50 analytical uncertainty -1.00 δ²⁰²Hg (permil) -1.50



742 Figure 3.



Figure 4.





Figure 5.

